

PAPER

The effectiveness of enrichment triad model to enhance students' learning outcomes of history learning

To cite this article: Sumardi *et al* 2019 *IOP Conf. Ser.: Earth Environ. Sci.* **243** 012164

View the [article online](#) for updates and enhancements.



IOP | ebooks™

Bringing you innovative digital publishing with leading voices to create your essential collection of books in STEM research.

Start exploring the [collection](#) - download the first chapter of every title for free.

The effectiveness of enrichment triad model to enhance students' learning outcomes of history learning

Sumardi¹, R A Surya^{1*}, and M Naim¹

¹Department of Social Science Studies, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, Universitas Jember, Jl. Kalimantan 37, Jember 68121, Indonesia

*email : surya_riza@unej.ac.id

Abstract. The requirement of the 21st century proposes many innovation of several facets. Education as a mean of changes plays important role in developing a nation. Meanwhile, there are several issues found which promotes education quality becomes decrease. In order to improve education quality is strengthening educational research. Educational research is a concrete attempt to resolve and develop education practices and provides expected human resources. Many research tried to examine new methods, strategies, techniques within education practice in order to meet learning goals. This article focuses on a new method designed by Joseph Renzulli named Enrichment Triad Model to deal with educational issues found nowadays in the classroom, particularly history learning. Enrichment is a learning method applied to enrich many aspects within learning process. This study is quasi-experimental design. The results based on independent t-test show that Enrichment Triad Model significantly enhances students' history learning outcomes.

1. Introduction

Pedagogy notion is extremely related to education practice, which implies towards mastering skills. Eventually, those skill are expected to meet society needs. The role of education institution becomes more and more complex due to Industrial Revolution 4.0 demands. Education itself has incarnate not only in the sense of humanism fashion, but also grows a means of achieving considerable goals of life. Thus, current education pattern commonly floats within progressive path. Considering the prominence of education appearance, it has been made both innovation and improvement towards educational practice and theory.

There are several factors affecting pedagogy become ineffective and meaningless, such learning process which has not really been innovative and creative upon students diversity and their environment. A measure that may be performed is conducting educational research as much as possible. It is considered as a concrete attempt to improve and develop education practices, so that education subjectives can be achieved. In addition, effective school development also requires a comprehensive scheme of measure that is perceptive to the particular conditions of the school population. This paper attempts to propose a promising learning method in facilitating students characteristics and learning objectives at the same time.

The educator who obtains a solid objective cannot neglect on their teaching praxis demanding onto critical ability, curiosity, and learner autonomy. One of the essential duty of teaching practice is to associate the students to the methodological exactitude with which they should approach the learning, through learning materials that are knowable. Methodological exactitude is not related to 'banking system,' which merely examines the surface of the subject or its contents. This method means that to teach cannot be reduced to a superficial relation towards the contents but spreads to the establishment of the circumstance in which critical learning is possible [1]. Still, despite a progressive theme has shadowed educative practice which favors students autonomy, teacher possess essential figure within learning process. Teacher should be ethically grounded and preserve professional character in all aspects in order to grasp respect and loyalty.

History is a social science discipline which embedding knowledge and values relates to change and development of Indonesia and society of the world in the past. The most widely accepted definition of history is the study of change overtime [2]. The changes are such social, cultural, political, and economical state that happened by human beings. Stearns argues that history composes the study of changes, which the most notable factors are continuity and causation. Learning history



'for its own sake' related to the notion of liberal education, means examining element subjects matter discipline in certain depth for what they have to offer. In the light of history, the assumption of studying will not only promote a person more informed, in a classical stage, history will socially and intellectually improve a person. The view of history learning absolutely has a plenty of purposed goals and the argument could thereby be built that the position does not constitute learning history for its own sake.

Muslow argues that historical knowledge is found by a manner called a practice by those who convince the probability of absolute understanding of the past, which streams the format of its way in overcoming towards the trail of the past [3]. History known as bank of memories of unknown things, history delivers our prominent cultural resources. History also plays as means in going into the kind of experience that simply not possible in our own lives [4]. Learning history evokes a rational to preserve and maintain cultural identity of a nation and how the significant values had been handed down to the younger generation. It is expected that younger generation will likely possess original thought of how their nation was established then demonstrate heroic notions upon their daily life. Thus, history subject plays significance part in shaping students characteristic and introducing national identity in the early age.

Since, teaching history is slightly different to teaching other subjects. History classroom is different to Science and Mathematic and also rather different to humanities, such English, Social Studies, Geography and Politics [5]. The current situation that often occurs during history learning process is monotonous circumstance which engages traditional approach. In the typical classrooms, there is a tendency for history subject to be delivered based on textbook as the main knowledge that is cast in concrete. Due to this state, history learning commonly involves only a single set of answer and students are not expected to examine, interpret or construct their own opinions about the information that is presented towards them [6].

This article proposes a method which can be utilized for history learning that meets all necessities needed for learning subjectives as well as students needs in order to enhance learning outcomes. Enrichment Triad Model a.k.a ETM is the first ever enrichment program developed by Joseph Renzulli. It became the foundation of the next programs designed afterwards, thus ETM is considered the most original and authentic one. Enrichment term was originally associated to the gifted program, but eventually it turned out to be successful in regular classroom. ETM does not only involve high-level students, but also regular students, anytime and anywhere [6]. The prominence of this learning program that it takes into account namely student's characteristics, learning style, and interests by accommodating varies learning activities [7].

It has been said that there are some abilities level of each classroom, and it is necessary to determine amenities needed to complete learners developmental stage. Despite, there are some approve that variety of ability may show up, thus they disagree to put students who considered talented/gifted should be provided with peculiar learning activities. The fact, heterogenous classification sometimes grasp the idea that all students have equal access to the general classroom with blended level of learners ability. In other words, some students who are capable far beyond most, and who deserve the appropriate concern, learning and teaching environment that may facilitate their needs for exceedingly high-level thinking, content, and performance [8]. This phenomenon promoted Renzulli to design a special program for gifted/talented students which was started by Enrichment Triad Model program.

According to Davis [10] the enrichment term was derived from "enrich" means an attempt in enriching and adding something. It has been said to be utilized as enrichment program. English Oxford Dictionary proposes enrichment as an action related to the improvement act or quality/value addition of something. Enrichment provides rich and various learning activities. It delivers a deeper content compared to the conventional/regular curriculum. Enrichment typically includes new and more complex topic, in which learning content is accelerated than usual [11].

Referring to Renzulli, gifted-talented students behaviour is formed of interaction by three components, as follows; creativity, motivation, and high-level capacity [12]. He suggested an enrichment program aims to provide special teaching and learning for gifted-talented students. This program comprises of three levels; (i) general exploratory activities, (ii) general training activities, and (iii) individual and small investigation of real problems [13].

Enrichment Triad Model was originally constructed in assisting students with high academic ability due to conventional curriculum had not been supported those who were said talented and gifted [14]. Due to ETM successful, Renzulli then constructed several principal in completing Enrichment Triad Model for regular curriculum. Enrichment program was no longer attached towards gifted-talented students, but also all learners with variety ability. It can be performed within regular classroom, acceleration classroom, workgroup, or even in the laboratorium [15]. Enrichment Triad Model was designed based on psychological approach of students development stages which has several advantages compared to other methods. Despite, Enrichment Triad Model was just began in 1970's, previous research results indicate that enrichment based learning delivers numerous benefits both for students and teachers [16],[17].

Enrichment Triad Model has three main types which teachers may modify adjusting to students' needs. Those three types namely (i) general exploratory activities, (ii) general training activities, and (iii) individual and small investigation of real problems. The first two types are considered suitable for all learners, despite the two other types are also essential for gifted and talented students. At least for two reasons. First, these two enrichment types are related to strategy for developing students interests and improving the thinking process, thus both are considered necessary components in any enrichment program. Second, enrichment type I and II represent logical input and support system for type III enrichment, which it is assumed to be the only one that is proper for gifted learners [12], [13], [14], [15].

Research regarding history of the liberal education tradition is considered to provide prominent transfer in knowledge and skills. Referring to a study which examines the assumption upon the knowledge transmission in terms of liberal education, performed by [20] Thorndike (1924) is frequently cited. It shows a small development in judgement performance during learning process such History and Latin compared to condition not examining these materials [21].

One of the main subjectives of history learning is providing students ability in historical reconstruction. The historical reconstruction has several aspects to be achieved regarding history learning as follows; (1) identifying of significant parts of history to liberate human beings and their environments, (2) understanding (vestehen) upon hermeneutic affinity and human wishes, reality balance between objective and subjective, and (3) grasping the spirit a particular period of history as shown by the ideas and beliefs of the time 'Zeitgeist,' so that students become actively and properly put the events without being trapped on prejudice, and manipulate intellectual manner to meet shorttime needs [22]. Thus, it is important to give assistance for students who have not obtained a generalized overview about history events by utilizing a proper method in learning.

In delivering past events, frequently found learning process were neglected the truth due to the national proud and being mutilated as for keeping nationalism notions. In one hand, a narrowed-sight of nationalism has put history learning as a means of nationalism encouragement. In the other hand, the recent young generation should arise to recognize the diversity of human beings and learn that past has made other countries as seen now, in which the same situation had happened to their country as well. A Proper history instruction allows students become critical and humanist. On the contrary, inadequate history learning practice may promote students being radical followers of certain ism(s). These consequences occur once students already obtain ability to develop historical thinking skills.

History can be defined as the story of present which depicts the past events, and its values lies in the interaction of the two. In order to conceive history, it is not sufficient to notice the past, it also a must to sense the terms of the nature of the present desire for the past [23]. Currently, typical history learning is monotonous. Student tend to stay passive and unable to express their ideas properly due to limited methods and amenities used by teachers. History learning commonly had not been take into account students' characteristics to determine learning activities [24]. Relating the teaching issues, many textbooks are made in encouraging the improvement both skill and competency. Some assignments involved in a variety of documentary sources, in which historical issues and research proposal are released, as well as given information to be discussed based on several respects. In fact, these types of practical and engaging activities that lead to historical thinking are marginal in comparison with those based on historical knowledge [25].

History in the light of education is something being thought, discussed, and related to events and facts [26]. Event is considered history if meets (1) ties up to space and time, (2) social related, (3) has social meaning. History learning upon primary and secondary education exposes history as events

meaning. Hence, History is sequential events with pattern and purposes [26]. History learning anticipates values and meaning of the events to achieve historical awareness.

As noted by Wineberg and Wilson, teacher knowledge or subject matter includes not only knowledge of historical information per se but also knowledge of what [27] called “wisdom of practice.” This term means the beliefs, values, knowledge of procedures, and skills that teachers obtained after years of experience [28].

Learning outcomes are statements of what learner is expected to know, understand and be able to demonstrate at the end of a period of learning. Learning outcome is often regarded as academic achievement that is whole efficiency and results achieved through learning process in schools that expressed by numbers [26]. Typically, the main goal of enrichment learning is to provide regular school curriculum with additional content and activities, thus it needs to promote students’ motivation and fostering the students’ social skills, independence, self-esteem, and interpersonal ability. Enrichment stands up upon inner motivation of students learning incentives and creates various possibilities for intensifying knowledge, creative and research achievements. In this sense, teacher assesses the learning outcomes in many ways and above all the evaluations that goes beyond the limits of regular school assessment.

Learning was differentiated based on needs of the students by textbooks usage with various level of reading or topics, skills and process identification that student requires to achieve proper outcomes for different learning assignments, and flexible groupings, which students are taught in small groups of several size, based on need and interest identification. Classroom will likely become active learning environment and the role between student and teacher shifts significantly. The teacher becomes the students’ facilitator and students become more independent learners [18]. By engaging Enrichment Triad Model to guide curriculum planning, opportunities that were earlier reserved for talented/gifted students were available to all students in the regular classroom [8].

Furthermore, enrichment triad model is considered as an alternative method of history learning applied aiming to achieve satisfying learning goals. ETM learning scheme does not only cover analytical-based topic and problem solving, but also accommodates low-level thinking requirement topic. It has gradual steps to provide time for students in adjusting lesson towards their capability [19].

Learning outcomes are representation of what students expected to know, understand and/or be able to demonstrate at the final period of learning. History subject assessment basically similar to other subjects. According to [9] history learning assessment must take into account history features. There are three aspects to be considered, namely cognitive, affective, and psychomotor.

2. Methods

This research engaged quantitative approach with quasi experiment design. It attempts to identify control group which obtains similar characteristics upon experimental group, that is condition before intervention. By identifying control group, we may recognize the differences impacts between two groups. This design mostly alike pretest-posttest control group design, in which both groups were not selected randomly. Samples were eleventh grade of social studies department, with 20 students of each class. Both groups then given pretest to determine students’ prior knowledge and t-test was engaged to determine to homogenous level of ability. Posttest was given after particular treatment was provided towards experimental group. Data analysis technique utilized independent t-test.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Results

The study was conducted in Madrasah Aliyah Nahdlatul Ulama Asembagus, Situbondo, East Java, Indonesia. Experimental group was given enrichment triad model and control group with conventional learning. During pretest, both experimental and control groups gained similar level, namely 54,8 and 54. After a month in enrichment triad model within experimental group, researchers then performed post-test. It can be seen from figure 2 that experimental group obtains slightly higher average than control group. In order to confirm these results, researcher then should conduct independent t-test. In doing so, data obtained should meet normality and homogeneity level. Normality data was examined using Shapiro-Wilk, while homogeneity level using One Way Anova. Based on independent t test of

post-test, which obtained significance by 0.014, means Enrichment Triad Model significantly improves students' history learning outcomes.

Table 1. Pretest Scores

Groups	Lowest Score	Highest Score	Average
experimental	36	72	54,8
control	40	72	54

Table 2. Post-test Scores

Groups	Lowest Score	Highest Score	Average
experimental	68	92	80
control	64	88	76

Table 3. Pretest Independent T Test

	Levene's test for Equality for Variances								
	F	Sig.	t	df	Sig.	Mean Difference	Std. Error Dif.	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
								Lower	Upper
Equal variances Assumed	2.484	.123	.239	38	.813	.80000	3.35418	-5.99018	7.59018
Equal variances not assumed			.239	35.611	.813	.80000	3.35418	-6.00517	7.60517

Table 4. Post test Normality Level

Groups	Kolmogorov-Smirnov			Shapiro-Wilk		
	Statistic	df	Sig.	Statistic	df	Sig.
experimental	144	20	.200 [*]	.962	20	.592
control	150	20	.200 [*]	.961	20	.556

Table 5. Post-test Homogeneity Level

Levene Statistic	df1	df2	Sig.
.007	1	38	.933

Table 6. Post-test Independent Samples Test

	Levene's test for Equality for Variances								
	F	Sig.	t	df	Sig.	Mean Difference	Std. Error Dif.	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
								Lower	Upper
Equal variances Assumed	.007	.933	2.57	38	.014	.50000	1.94395	1.06468	8.93532
Equal variances not assumed			2.57	37.817	.014	.50000	1.94395	1.06405	8.93595

3.2. *The Relationship Between Enrichment Triad Model and History Learning*

Research regarding history of the liberal education tradition is considered to provide prominent transfer in knowledge and skills. Referring to a study which examines the assumption upon the knowledge transmission in terms of liberal education, performed by [20] Thorndike (1924) is frequently cited. It shows a small development in judgment performance during learning process such History and Latin compared to condition not examining these materials [21].

One of the main subjectives of history learning is providing students ability in historical reconstruction. The historical reconstruction has several aspects to be achieved regarding history learning as follows; (1) identifying of significant parts of history to liberate human beings and their environments, (2) understanding (vestehen) upon hermeneutic affinity and human wishes, reality balance between objective and subjective, and (3) grasping the spirit a particular period of history as shown by the ideas and beliefs of the time 'Zeitgeist,' so that students become actively and properly put the events without being trapped on prejudice, and manipulate intellectual manner to meet shorttime needs [22]. Thus, it is important to give assistance for students who have not obtained a generalized overview about history events by utilizing a proper method in learning.

In delivering past events, frequently found learning process were neglected the truth due to the national proud and being mutilated as for keeping nationalism notions. In one hand, a narrowed-sight of nationalism has put history learning as a means of nationalism encouragement. In the other hand, the recent young generation should arise to recognize the diversity of human beings and learn that past has made other countries as seen now, in which the same situation had happened to their country as well. A Proper history instruction allows students become critical and humanist. On the contrary, inadequate history learning practice may promote students being radical followers of certain ism(s). These consequences occur once students already obtain ability to develop historical thinking skills.

History can be defined as the story of present which depicts the past events, and its values lies in the interaction of the two. In order to conceive history, it is not sufficient to notice the past, it also a must to sense the terms of the nature of the present desire for the past [23]. Currently, typical history learning is monotonous. Student tend to stay passive and unable to express their ideas properly due to limited methods and amenities used by teachers. History learning commonly had not been take into account students' characteristics to determine learning activities [24]. Relating the teaching issues, many textbooks are made in encouraging the improvement both skill and competency. Some assignments involved in a variety of documentary sources, in which historical issues and research proposal are released, as well as given information to be discussed based on several respects. In fact, these types of practical and engaging activities that lead to historical thinking are marginal in comparison with those based on historical knowledge [25].

History in the light of education is something being thought, discussed, and related to events and facts [26]. Event is considered history if meets (1) ties up to space and time, (2) social related, (3) has social meaning. History learning upon primary and secondary education exposes history as events meaning. Hence, History is sequential events with pattern and purposes [26]. History learning anticipates values and meaning of the events to achieve historical awareness.

As noted by Wineberg and Wilson, teacher knowledge or subject matter includes not only knowledge of historical information per se but also knowledge of what [27] called "wisdom of practice." This term means the beliefs, values, knowledge of procedures, and skills that teachers obtained after years of experience [28].

Learning outcomes are statements of what learner is expected to know, understand and be able to demonstrate at the end of a period of learning. Learning outcome is often regarded as academic achievement that is whole efficiency and results achieved through learning process in schools that expressed by numbers [26].

History learning is a discipline relates facts within history, yet takes into account common educational purposes [9]. History as a subject obtains mission and objectives. History as a discipline should be elaborated towards solid concept without neglecting essential principal of both aspects. The development and improvement of learning and reasoning in history subject has been conducted, some what sparingly, with results suggesting that a number of practices are able to generate such improvement.

3.3 Discussion

Method as part of learning model is considered essential within education. Learning model according to Joyce and Weil is planning or pattern being used to construct curriculum, designing teaching material, also guidance of classroom teaching. Teaching is a process between learner and teacher generates learning environment which involved values and belief. Learning method engaged by educator must meet all needs upon class circumstance and views appearance due to student and teacher interaction [19]. Therefore, suitable model, strategy, and method selection is teacher's duty to optimize learning goals.

Theoretical basis upon enrichment triad model achievement in improving history learning outcome can be recognized in some points. First, Enrichment triad model proposes constructivism and cognitivism paradigm by adding learning content material. It enhances critical and creative learning which is associated to history learning features. Second, Enrichment triad model plays significant role to develop students' motivation. Furthermore, enrichment-based learning has positive relation to incline self-efficacy and self-regulation [29]. This aspect can be seen on Type III Tipe III (Individual & Small Group Investigation of Real Problems). Type III has problem solving component in which students are involved on inquiry activity. Students will be placed as professionals to solve certain issues.

In the sense of history learning, by engaging Enrichment Triad Model learning process not only possess "fishing-for-facts approach," but also commit to "fising" response, despite it will be varying. Third, enrichment triad model is based on students interests and passion. Enrichment learning pays attention upon students diversity and characteristics. It is associated to Piaget's that all learning process has to derive from students' interests and activities [30]. Forth, enrichment triad model requires workgroup formation during learning process. Workgroup importance of learning has been existed long ago, but it increased massively in early 1960's. Students will likely find it easier to learn, if they were involved on learning interaction, such discussion and sharing. Beside, workgroup is being suggested regarding to social needs, it illustrates how society works [31].

Fifth, enrichment triad model is also integrated to Positive Cognitive Intervention (PCI). PCI is assumed to be feedback both orally and literally. As it has been said that feedback upon learning is significance within transformational learning and conceptual development, thus it has been included in constructivism based learning [32]. PCI affects considerably towards self-esteem improvement and required to support students inner motivation. During history learning ETM based, despite students perform learning independently within groups, teacher possess role both as facilitator and observer. Continously, teacher provide advice, guidance, and motivation that aims students to be confidence and committed to complete the assignments.

Sixth, factor related to activities and learning material integration upon ETM. As mentioned above, ETM offers plenty activities, contents, and material than conventional learning. It associates to history learning in which composes of many facts and concepts that demands student ability in analytical thinking. Cultural, experience, and characteristic of students shape the class atmosphere. The hererogen state promotes standar improvement in learning by giving a certain responsibility towards teacher and school to provide equal achievements amongs students [33]. In addition, [34] argue that suitable teacher is who obtains several teaching styles and those were flexible to grasp some strategies and techniques, also adaptive towards learning and teaching changes.

Students' achievements are indispensable upon constructivism learning theory. Constructivism theory according to [35] cognitive capacity is adaptive, means cognitive ability is not to propose a reality, yet to improve individual experience management. It matches to Glasersfeld [36] that learning is not stimulus-respond event, but a process requires self-regulation and conceptual structure development through reflection and abstraction.

4. Conclusions

Based on description above, models, strategies, and methods selection is essential in constructing learning activities, learning environment, and learning experiences. A method is unlikely able to grasp all learning subjectives and accomodate students learning style. Yet, there is always a method that most suitable which meets "fit-proper" enables learning achievements. Enrichment triad model is an alternative method used in history subject in order to complete learning goals. This method does not only assist analytical and problem solving ability, but also accomodate content characteristics which

only demands understanding capacity. Furthermore, enrichment triad model syntax is gradual, means student will be able to adjust their individual capacity towards learning subjectives. In addition, enrichment triad model also increases students motivation and interest, since learning activities are vary without neglecting learning values themselves. This rational explains why Enrichment Triad Model increases students history learning outcomes.

Acknowledgments

The author appreciates many support of Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, Jember University. As well as those who are unable to mention one by one.

References

- [1] Freire P 1996 *Pedagogy of Freedom : Ethics, Democracy, and Civic Courage* (USA :Rowman & Littlefield)
- [2] Stearns P N 1998 *International review of History. Learning and Reasoning in History*, Vol 2 281-293
- [3] Munslow A 1999 *Deconstructing History* (Routledge: London)
- [4] Tosh J 1984 *The Pursuit of History* (Routledge: London)
- [5] Tan H D (2004) *Teaching and Learning*, **25**(2), p 197–206
- [6] Reis, S M, & Renzulli, J S 1994 *THE SCHOOLWIDE ENRICHMENT MODEL : A FOCUS ON STUDENT STRENGTHS* p 1–24
- [7] Renzulli J S 1976 *THE ENRICHMENT TRIAD MODEL : A GUIDE FOR DEVELOPING DEFENSIBLE PROGRAMS FOR THE*, **XX**(3), p 303–326.
- [8] Renzulli, J, & Reis, S 2007 *Gifted Education Press Quarterly*, **21**(4), p 2–9.
- [9] Widja I G 1989 *Dasar-dasar Pengembangan Strategi serta Metode Pengajaran Sejarah* (Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan)
- [10] Davis A G 2012 *Anak Berbakat dan Pendidikan Anak Berbakat, Ter. Ati Cahyani* (Jakarta: PT. Indeks)
- [11] Surya, R A, Handayani, S, & Soepeno, B 2015 *Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa*, **1**(I), p 1–7.
- [12] Jean, E G 1995 *Research Related to the Enrichment Triad Model* (Washington: University of Connecticut)
- [13] Cepero M 2008 *The Enrichment Triad Model*
<https://doi.org/doi.org/10.1080/14703290802176238>
- [14] Reis, S M 1981 *Key Features of Successful Programs for the Gifted and Talented*
- [15] Renzulli, J S 1968 2/4/09 *Joseph S. Renzulli University of Connecticut Board of Trustees Distinguished Professor Doctor of Laws*, (2003).
- [16] Dumke, E K., Vanderwielen, L, Harris, K. A., & Ford-Smith, C. D. 2016 *Journal of Interprofessional Care*, **30**(2), p 245–247. <https://doi.org/10.3109/13561820.2015.1089224>
- [17] Suhail, M 2014 *Effects of Enrichment Programs on the Academic Achievement of Gifted and Talented Students* **2**(2), p 22–27
- [18] Beecher, M, & Sweeny, S M 2008 *Journal of Advanced Academics* **19**(3), p 502–530
- [19] Surya, R A 2018 *Pengaruh Penerapan Enrichment Triad Model dan Self-confidence terhadap Hasil Belajar Sejarah Madrasah Aliyah Nahdlatul Ulama (MANU) Asembagus Situbondo*. (Malang: Universitas Negeri Malang)
- [20] Thorndike E L 1924 *Journal of Educational Psychology* **15**(1), 1-22.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/h0075386>
- [21] Voss, J F 1999 *Issues in Education* Vol 4, (4) p 163-209
- [22] Kristiyanto E 2008 *Sejarah sebagai Locus Philosophicus et Theologicus* (Yogyakarta: Penerbit Lamalera)
- [23] Hendrick C W 2006 *Ancient History: Document and Monument* (UK: Blacwell Publishing)
- [24] Surya R A, Sri H & Bambang S 2015. *Penerapan Remedial Dan Enrichment Model Renzulli Untuk Meningkatkan Keaktifan Dan Hasil Belajar Sejarah Peserta Didik Smk Negeri 1Jember* (Jember : Universitas Jember)
- [25] Molina, S, Gomez, C, & Ortuno, J 2014 *International Journal of Historical Learning, Teaching* **12**(12.2)
- [26] Adrini, V. S. 2016 *Journal of Education and Practice* **7**(3), 38–42

- [27] Shulman L S 1987 *Harvard Educational Review*, p 57-122
- [28] Shulman, L E 2011 *Understand : Knowledge* **15**(2), p 4–14
- [29] Pereira, S, Peters, S, & Gentry, M. 2010. *Journal of Advanced* **2** (1)
- [30] Piaget J 1975 *The Development of Thought: Equilibration on of Cognitive Structures* (New York: Viking)
- [31] Reynolds M 1994 *Groupwork in Education and Training* (London: Kogan Page)
- [32] Montgomery D 2009 *Able, Gifted and Talented Underachievers (Second Edition)*(West Sussex: Willey-Blackwell)
- [33] Rose D H 2002 *Teaching Every Student in the Digital Age* (USA: ASCD)
- [34] Callahan, Joseph, F, & Clark, Leonard, H 1977. *Teaching in the Middle and Secondary Schools* (New York: Macmillan Publishing Co., Inc)
- [35] Glasersfeld 1989 *Supplement Vol.1*.Oxford/(New York: Pergamon Press) p 162-163.
- [36] Olusegun S 2015 *Journal of Research & Method in Education* Volume **5** (6) p 66-70

