

INTEGRATING POLITICAL CARTOON INTO CIVIC EDUCATION TEACHING AND LEARNING (PENGINTEGRASIAN KARTUN POLITIK DALAM PENDIDIKAN KEWARGANEGARAAN)

Yayuk Mardiaty¹⁾
mardiaty_2@yahoo.com

¹⁾ Program Studi Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar, FKIP, Universitas Jember

Abstract: This study implements political cartoon to develop Indonesian students' critical thinking skills on Indonesian political culture. The participants involves undergraduate students of elementary education program, or SI PGSD in the Faculty of Teacher Training, Jember University academic year 2014/2015. By integrating political cartoon in civic education enables students to develop civics knowledge, civics skills, and civics participation. Implementation of a unit plan with visual representation enables students to actively engage and learn through the analysis and interpretation of political cartoon and to expand their understanding of the Indonesian political culture. These Indonesian political culture include *golput* (lit.white group), *politik dagang sapi* (lit.political cow trade), *politik uang* (money politics), *politik blusukan* (lit. impromptu visits). Encounter with these visual representation through the medium of political cartoon promotes students' understanding of the meaning and importance of ethical decision making. During their involvement of the course the partisipants deepen their knowledge of Indonesian political processes and learn how to teach them in their own teaching.

Abstrak : Studi ini mengimplementasikan kartun politik untuk mengembangkan ketrampilan berpikir kritis mahasiswa tentang budaya politik Indonesia. Partisipan studi ini meliputi mahasiswa SI PGSD, FKIP Universitas Jember tahun akademik 2014/2015. Dengan memadukan kartun politik dalam pendidikan kewarganegaraan memungkinkan mahasiswa mengembangkan pengetahuan, ketrampilan, dan partisipasi warga negara. Implementasi KKNi melalui kartun politik memungkinkan mahasiswa terlibat secara aktif dalam menganalisis dan interpretasi kartun politik untuk memperluas pemahaman tentang budaya politik Indonesia. Budaya politik yang dianalisis meliputi *golput*, *politik dagang sapi*, *politik uang*, dan *blusukan*. Dengan mengkonter representasi visual melalui medium kartun politik mampu mempromosikan pemahaman mahasiswa tentang makna dan pentingnya membuat keputusan yang etis. Selama keterlibatannya dalam perkuliahan pendidikan kewarganegaraan, mahasiswa memperdalam pengetahuan tentang proses politik Indonesia dan bagaimana membelajarkannya sendiri di sekolah.

Kata kunci:, Political cartoon, *golput*, *politik dagang sapi*, *politik uang*, *blusukan*

INTRODUCTION

Purpose and Central Questions

Social studies encompasses a field of specialization that includes a variety of social sciences content areas as well as humanities (NCSS, 2010). This study of political science, critical and higher order thinking skills joins a growing body of research on the use of political cartoon for instructional purposes. Susan (1995), Burack (1995), and Werner (2004) found that using carefully selected political cartoons enables students necessary to counter images and to stimulate thinking through arts where direct experiences are impossible and undesirable. These researchers use these findings to argue that student encounters with political cartoons engages students' interest and foster higher order thinking. Researchers criticize the conventional approaches of text and lecture, which dominates social studies and civic education classrooms, hinder autonomous thinking (Ravitch, 1992). This has led to students regarding social studies, including civic education as the most boring subject that they encounter during their elementary schooling (Hirsch, 1987).

Some scholars and educators believe that using an integrated or interdisciplinary approach, which constructs or tie new knowledge across subjects enhances students' critical thinking skills and enlarges students' understanding of the content areas they study (Eisner 1982, Boyer 2004). The social studies curriculum should become integrated by including concepts across subjects, including political science (Werner, 2004). The research positions Indonesian undergraduate students of prospective elementary school teachers actively integrate elements of history, language arts, political science, and geography through encountering political cartoons. The purpose of integrating political science in civic education is to analyze political cartoons that include *Golput* (lit. white group), *Politik Dagang Sapi* (lit. trade cow politics), *Politik Uang* (money politics), and *Blusukan* (impromptu visits). The research was conducted at the Faculty of Teacher Training and Educational Sciences, Jember University, East Java Indonesia.

Although Indonesia's new elementary school curriculum emphasizes affective/civic competence through thematic integrated, practitioners are still struggling with effective ways to implement civic education project (Kompas, 2014). These failures have been due, a significant extent, to the teachers' confusion over to implement and engage students with interdisciplinary approach on political education. Ultimately, the fundamental issue pivots around how to apply civic education theory and interdisciplinary practice in elementary classrooms.

The current research focuses on civic education through the medium of Indonesian political cartoon to pre-servive elementary teacher training in Jember university, Indonesia. The research seeks to advance how an interdisciplinary approach, which integrates the

content area of Indonesian political cartoon into teaching civic education to analyze political culture of Indonesia. This research project, therefore, facilitates implementation of the new curriculum emphasizing an interdisciplinary approach to political culture education in Indonesia.

Implementing abstract concepts, such as politics requires among teachers' robust knowledge of political science as well as a wide array of pedagogical skills. Although attaining such skills and knowledge is challenging, working with political cartoons equips undergraduate students and future teachers for awareness of democratic participation. This research project is very crucial for prospective elementary school teachers to enhance the Indonesian students' higher order thinking skills as an essential requirement for citizenship in a democracy.

Research Questions

The study intends to answer the following questions:

- a. How does the power of Indonesian political cartoons enable participants to exploration of the culture of Indonesian politics.
- b. How does the integration of Indonesian political cartoons foster students to promote awareness in civic life ?
- c. How do students' own political cartoons reveal cultural politics ?

The research here answers these questions through implementation of a course work titled "Integrating Indonesian Political Cartoon Into Civic Education Teaching and Learning" to undergraduate students of primary school teacher training (SI PGSD), the faculty of teacher training and educational sciences, Jember University, Indonesia. The implementation of the material yields data for answering these key research questions above.

RESEARCH METHOD

This research employs a conventional qualitative observation method with a researcher intervention on integration of Indonesian political cartoon into civic education course. In *Qualitative Research and Case Study Applications in Education*, Meriam (1998) notes that the "Basic qualitative study seeks to discover and understand a phenomenon, a process, or the perspectives and world views of the people involved" (p.11). This study will present undergraduate students' views on how civic education is taught and their understanding of politics.

This part of the research coheres with Patton's (1995) observation that qualitative

research “is an effort to understand situation in their uniqueness” (p.1). At first, the research will not attempt to predict what may happen as a result of the participants’ inquiry into Indonesian political culture through political cartoon. Rather, the research seeks to understand what civic education and democracy means to the subjects. Again to cite Patton (1995) the study first probes:

“the nature of setting [a school and classroom] – what it means for participants to be in that setting, what their lives are like, what’s going on for them, and what their meaning are, what the world looks like in that particular setting – and in that analysis to be able to communicate that faithfully to others who interested in that setting” (p.1).

Having investigated the school and classroom setting, the study implements the Integration of Indonesian Political Cartoon into Civic Education Teaching and Learning.

The implementation of material engages subject inquiries or exploration of Indonesian cultural politics draw upon four Indonesian political cartoons. The activities provide subjects through analyzing Indonesian political cartoons in groups. Subsequently, the researcher has participants reflect upon civic education’s values and practices. The other material includes a project on “Drawing Own Political Cartoon” where a student artist draws three cartoons which reveal Indonesian political culture. This accords with Fogarty (1991) who has urged educators of civic education have their students interpret, analyze, and evaluate work of arts. This implies that the incorporation of a process into exploration of political cartoon, would focus students on learning to make sense of the content in a real context so that their learning will be meaningful to them.

Data gathering involves first-hand observation where the researcher interacts through open-ended questions given to the subjects. In accordance with Human Subjects Review requirements, participants will be told that the study will not affect their grades in civic education course.

To gain access to the research site the researcher asks the dean of the faculty of teacher training and educational sciences, Jember University for permission to study the class. The researcher conducted the research for the entire odd semester of 2014.

The research tools used to collect data were both manual and mechanical. The manual devices include field-notes, journals, and the researcher’s hand-out. The mechanical devices includes camera and lap-top computer. All data gathered addressed the questions in the statements of the problem.

The Research Project

The research employs a student-centered approach, which positions participants in their analysis of Indonesian cultural politics exhibited within political cartoons. Political cartoon is defined as illustrations or comic strips containing a political or social message that usually relates to current events or personalities (The Library of Congress, 2014). There are some persuasive techniques used in political cartoon; **Symbolism** where cartoonists use simple objects or **symbols** to stand for larger concepts or ideas. **Exaggeration** where sometimes cartoonists overdo or **exaggerate** the physical characteristics of people or things in order to make a point. **Labeling**, cartoonists often **label** objects or people to make it clear exactly what they stand for. **Analogy** is a comparison between two unlike things that share some characteristics. By comparing a complex issue or situation with a more familiar one, cartoonists can help their readers see it in a different light. **Irony** is the difference between the ways things are and the way things should be or the way things are expected to be. Cartoonists often use irony to express their opinion on an issue (The Library of Congress, 2014).

The research centers upon four themes of Indonesian political cartoons; *Golput* (lit. white group), *Trade Cow Politics* (lit. politik dagang sapi), *Money Politics* (politik uang), and *Blusukan* (impromptu visits). This accords with Taylor and Iroha (2015) that contextual instruction and culturally responsive learners engage in the exploration of real-world problems and artistic and innovative solutions. By engaging students related to their context students' prior knowledge and experiences are recognized and integrated.

The political cartoon project was carried out during the odd semester of the 2014/2015 academic year. The research project was divided into three stages. The first stage was given to each group of six students' identification of Indonesian political cartoon in random. Group A obtained *golput* (lit. white group) as a theme or topic, group B gained a theme on *politik dagang sapi* (lit.cow trade politics), group C got theme on *politik uang* (money politics), and group D has *blusukan* (lit. impromptu visits) as a topic. Each group brainstormed and discussed the topic by using relevant articles related to the political cartoon they obtained.

The second stage of the project involved each group's exploration of art's or political cartoon's potential to persuade and inform public as well as the role of artists can be as agents of social and political change. During interactive lectures and discussions, open-ended questions were given to determine such students' views as what do you think the

causes of the increase of *golput*? Do you think there is an issue of *mistrust*? If so, what kind of politics which built that mistrust? Do you think there is an issue of *money politics*? Do you think there is an issue of *education* that causes the citizens do not know how to use their rights to vote? The group A' s response to these open-ended questions end up their findings reflecting on how political cartoons can be continuously used to influence people' s thoughts and actions.



Figure 1: Golput from <http://www.google.co.id>

The discussion of Group A' s theme on *golput* prompts Group B with open-ended questions with a political cartoon on *politik dagang sapi*, such as what does *politik dagang sapi* mean to you? How does it impact on decision making process? These questions enable students to analyze the issue of how the transactional system of political and public institutions work and its impact on the decision making process.



Figure 2: Student's Work of Art of 2014

Group C which has a political cartoon with a theme of *politik uang* enables students to response such questions as why the legislative candidate gives away money to such voters? What might happen if the candidate loose in the election? What might happen if the candidate wins in the election? Analyze the danger of *politik uang* on the process of democracy.



Figure 3: Student's work of art

Group D with the theme of *blusukan* allows students to analyze the iconic political art. In addition, with such open-ended questions as what does *blusukan* mean to you? What might *blusukan* mean to Jokowi? With these questions students consider it as historic, contemporary, and authentic.



Figure 4: Student's work of art

The third stage of the project required the application of knowledge through the creation of political cartoon designs. A student artist created designs using color pencils, pastels, and markers on paper of specific dimensions in order to be scanned. While engaged in this process, the student artist is suggested to provide spaces for the importance and relevance of the messages since the aim of the design catch the attention of the readership.

Findings

The findings of this study suggest that art-based project on political cartoon in civic education promotes students' critical thinking skills. Each member of the four groups states that they never use political cartoons in either social studies or civic education course before to challenge their thinking. Group A's response to open-ended questions on *golput* denotes students' critical thinking skills. For example, they defined *golput* as a group of people who do not use their rights to vote. Furthermore, they said that the *golput* people are apathetic, meaning that they are not concerned. In this case that they have political reasons because such public issues as the scarcity of LPJ, scarcity of fertilizer for farmers, and problems of poverty, unemployment, sanitation, and degradation of environment are not significantly resolved so that this group do not trust the candidate, but instead manifested by not voting.

Additionally, Group B's response on *politik dagang sapi* also shows students' critical thinking. Based on Indonesian dictionary (KBBI, 2013), *politik dagang sapi* means mutual bargaining among political parties to build a coalition of cabinet or institution. In a country that uses presidential system of multiparties, ontologically, the ethical purpose of this coalition is right and good for building a more good and clean governance. However, in reality what students observed, *politik dagang sapi* is nothing more than distribution of seats or power in the cabinet. It means epistemologically that, the application of coalition is transactional in nature. According to Northouse (2010) factors of transactional leadership which include contingent reward, an exchange process between leaders and followers in which the followers receive benefits for what they have done. This kind of transactional leadership would affect the decision making process. Further, this is in line with students' response to *politik dagang sapi* that the issue that stems from this transactional system do not promote significant change to the society because they are busy with their own coalition. Axiologically, this is contradictory with the country's goal to prosper the Indonesian society which also benefit the country.

Further, Group C's responses to open-ended questions on political cartoon *politik uang* denotes critical thinking, especially when money politics practice relates to cultural context. Examples of these are when the students' response to win or to lose in *pilkada* (district election). They said that when the candidate won in the election, they assumed that the candidate seeks funds in order to cover all expenses that had been given to the voters in time of campaign. Meanwhile, when the candidate lost in *pilkada* election, he or she got bankrupt and would possibly experience stressful situation. Therefore, money politics practice do not benefit to both candidates and voters. So, banning the practice of money

politics in any election is critical.

Interestingly, the last Group D's response to the open-ended questions of the political cartoon on Jokowi and Ahok is different from the other ones. By guiding students to find the term *blusukan* in the dictionary online it helps students to define what *blusukan* means. The term *blusukan* is derived from the Javanese word *blusuk* plus suffix *an*, (lit. got into). Politically, it means impromptu visits and *blusukan* for them (students) mean 'got into the roots', depending on the context. They give an example of 'pengajian blusukan' where the Imam gives the Koran teaching to ordinary people.

Meanwhile, they interpreted that *blusukan* for Jokowi means 'Jokowi has purposes to get into the roots', such as wants to know the community's problems and willing to communicate directly with the ordinary people (the roots). This kind of leadership approach is called authentic leadership. Avolio & Gardner (2005) defines authentic leaders as those who are deeply aware of how they think and behave and are perceived by others, as being aware of their own and others, have values/moral perspectives, knowledge, and strengths, aware of the conduct in which they operate and who are confident, hopeful, optimistic, resilient, and of high moral character. In time of mistrust between Indonesian leader and its citizens, the presence of such authentic leadership is badly needed.

Discussion

The aim of civic education is to emphasize Indonesian people to be good citizens. Being good citizens mean they have civic knowledge, civic skills, and civic participation. Democratic education that stresses interaction among students, the rights of students to be heard, the common good, and civic responsibility (Ligon, 2005), engaging students in meaningful discussion about issues is critical (Hess, 2009). Through open-ended discussions, students engage in a process of shared inquiry, expose to diverse perspectives, and they construct knowledge (Hess, 2009). Productive discussion occurs when students are part of the decision-making that impact their lives (Pearl & Knight, 1999). The research on implementing Indonesian political cartoons yielded significant findings. The majority of students reported that their awareness of community issues, such as *golput*, *politik dagang sapi*, and *politik uang* had increased and that they had had opportunity to express their concerns. Meanwhile, exploring such positive phenomenon as Jokowi's leadership through art was similarly important. Therefore, students could find a kind of balance in viewing thing. A number of students who involved in this project commented that the political cartoon they had studied was unique and fun, yet representing authenticity of their voices. This democracy

building at the local level may later lead to political involvement and policy development at higher level (Hollander & Harsey, 2003). Nearly all of the students conveyed the opinion that the creative teaching strategies through arts should be more implemented.

CONCLUSION

This study proposes to make scholarly contributions to several strands of academic inquiry. Foremost, the study found out that Indonesian political cartoon holds potential for increasing students' higher order thinking skills. While civic education educators would agree that teachers use Indonesian political cartoons to enhance inquiry of Indonesian political culture, no Indonesian teacher has systematically researched student interaction with work of arts to assess political cartoons' power for developing higher order thinking.

The study also recommends in-service elementary school teachers to integrate Indonesian political cartoons into civic education that has potential for enhancing students to draw their own political cartoons which focus their specific contexts and problems meaningful to them.

REFERENCES

- Boyer, B. (2004). *Young Adolescent Voices: Students' Perceptions of Interdisciplinary Teaming*. RMLE, v.I.
- Bruce, J. A & Garner, L (2005). *Authentic Leaderships*. The Leadership Quarterly 16: 315-338
- Burack, J. (1994). *Understanding and Creating Editorial Cartoons: A Resource Guide*. Madison WI: Knowledge Unlimited
- Drake, S.M. (1993). *Planning Integrated Curriculum: The call to adventure*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- Eisner, E.W. 1982. *Art, Music, and Literature Within Social Studies* in *handbook of Research on Social Studies Teaching and Learning*. James P. Shaver (ed.) (1991) New York: Macmillan Publishing Company.
- Fogarty, R. (1991). *How to Integrate the Curricula*. Palatine, IL: IRI/Skylight.
- Hess, D. (2009). *Controversy in the Classroom: The Democratic Power of Discussion*. New Journal of Social studies Education Research 2015: 6 (1), 1-25
- Hollander, E. & Harley, M. (2003). *Civic Renewal: A Powerful Framework for Advancing Service Learning*. In B. Jacoby (Ed). *Building Partnerships for Service Learning* (pp. 289-313). San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

- Jacquelin, S. (1984). *The Interdisciplinary Approach in Principals of Social Studies: The Why, What, and How of Social Studies Instruction*. Second Edition. Landam, MD University Press of America, Inc.
- (2014). *Kurikulum Tingkat Satuan Pendidikan: Sejumlah Sekolah Masih Kesulitan Menterjemahkan Standar Isi Versi BPSP*. Jakarta. Kompas Cyber Media.
- Ligon, J.A. (2005). *Transforming School into Democratic Sites*. In A. Pearl & C. R. Pryor (Eds.), *Democratic Practices in Education: Implication for Teacher Education* (pp. 1-8). Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield.
- Merriam, S.B. (1998). *Qualitative Research and Case Study Application in Education*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.
- Northouse, P.G. (2010). *Leadership: Theory and Practice* (5th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Patton, M. Q. (1990). *Qualitative Evaluation Methods* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Pearl, A. & Knight, T. (1999). *The Democratic Classroom: Theory to Inform Practice*. Cresskill: Hampton Press, Inc.
- Ravitch, D. (1992). *A Culture in Common*. Educational Leadership, 49, No. 4: 8-11
- Sternfirst, S. (1995). *Using Editorial Cartoons in the Curriculum to Enhance Visual (and Political Literacy): Traditional, Cultural, Technological*. Selected Papers from The Annual Conference of the International Association of School Librarianship, 63-69
- Taylor, J.A. & Iroha, O. (2015). *Social Studies Education and Public Art: The Detroit Billboard Project*. Journal of Social Studies Education Research, 6 (1): 1-25
- Werner, W. (2004). *On Political Cartoons with Social Studies Textbook: Visual Analysis Intertextuality, and Cultural Meaning*: Canadian Social Studies Vol. 38 NO. 2