

Digital Repository Universitas Jember



PROCEEDING

Feminist Theory and Practice: Efforts to Maintain Human Values

Editor:
L. Dyah Purwita Wardani SWW



Membangun Generasi
Menuju Insan Berprestasi

Jember, 21-22 October 2023

International Conference of Gender and Feminism

PROCEEDING
INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE OF GENDER
AND FEMINISM (ICOGEF)

“Feminist Theory and Practice: Efforts to Maintain Human Values”



Hall Universitas Jember
21-22 October 2023

UPT PENERBITAN
UNIVERSITAS JEMBER
2024

PROCEEDING INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE OF GENDER AND FEMINISM “Feminist Theory and Practice: Efforts to Maintain Human Values”

Organizing Committee:

| | |
|-------------|--|
| Chairperson | : L. Dyah Purwita Wardani SWW, S.S.,M.A. |
| Secretary | : Soekma Yeni Astuti S.Sn., M.Sn |
| Members | : Dr. Muhammad Irfan Hilmi, M.Pd., Didik Suharijadi SS, MA, Zahratul Umniyah SS, M.Hum |
| Treasure | : Deditiani Tri Indrianti S.Pd, M.Sc, CiQar |
| Editor | : L. Dyah Purwita Wardani SWW |
| Reviewer | : Muhammad Irfan Hilmi, Deditiani Tri Indrianti |

Steering Committee

Dr. Ir. Iwan Taruna, M.Eng.IPM (Rector of Universitas Jember)
Prof. Dr. Slamim M. Comp.Sc. Ph.D. (Vice rector for Academic)
Dr. Linda Eriyanti M.A. (Head of Center of Gender Studies-Universitas Jember)
Dr. Fanny Tanuwijaya, S.H., M.Hum (Head of Task Force for Preventing and Handling Sexual Violence-Universitas Jember)
Dr. Agustina Dewi Setyari S.S., M.Hum (Head of Indonesian Department-Faculty of Humanities)

ISBN : 978-623-477-126-8 (PDF)

Cetakan Pertama : Januari 2024

Layout dan Desain Sampul :

Risky Fahriza
Bambang Aris Kartika

Publisher:
UPT Penerbitan Universitas Jember

Publisher address:
Jalan Kalimantan 37
Jember 68121
Phone: 0331-330224, Voip.0319
e-mail: upt-penerbitan@unej.ac.id

Distributor:
Jember University Press
Jalan Kalimantan No.37 Jember
Telp. 0331-330224, Voip.0319

e-mail: uvt-penerbitan@unej.ac.id

Hak Cipta dilindungi Undang-Undang. Dilarang memperbanyak tanpa ijin tertulis dari penerbit, sebagian atau seluruhnya dalam bentuk apapun, baik cetak, photoprint, maupun microfilm.



PREFACE

Higher education has the responsibility to (1) make the life of the nation intelligent through developing abilities, forming national character and civilization with Pancasila character, (2) implementing the Tridharma to create an academic community profile that is innovative, responsive, creative, skilled, competitive and cooperative, and (3) developing science and technology with an insight into humanistic values. In this context and as a form of Universitas Jember's commitment to help build a dignified human civilization, the Center for Gender Studies at Universitas Jember has held an International Conference with the theme Feminism Theory and Practice: Efforts to Maintain Human Values on 21-22 October 2023 in Jember.

This chosen theme brings higher education attention to the importance of developing and strengthening feminist practices in facing the increasingly massive development of social, economic and political globalization. It involves actions, strategies and initiatives to raise awareness, overcome discrimination and work towards a more just society. Higher education has great potential to change this condition through organizing forums that facilitate scientific development with a gender-equitable perspective, placing women and men equally as essential subjects. Ideally, women's voices, which tend to be marginalized because they are considered unscientific, must be ensured to receive a particular place and attention because women's specific experiences regarding their bodies, the oppression experienced in their daily lives are valid, worthy of being used as a source of knowledge. This situation will encourage the development of scientific knowledge that is no longer masculine, which is colored by empathy and an ethic of care. Ultimately, this knowledge should also be considered as a reference for preserving and engineering culture, creating technology, and formulating gender-responsive policies.

This international conference activity was attended by various participants from within the country and abroad who work as lecturers, researchers, practitioners, observers, and students in various fields of science related to and relevant to the conference theme. This proceeding contributes to disseminating research results from the academic community who have participated and presented their articles at the conference. It is hoped that the various scientific papers produced and discussed during this conference will inspire the academic community to be more productive and create opportunities for improving the quality of Tridharma's work in the field of gender studies in the future.

As a closing introduction to these proceedings, we would like to express our deep gratitude to all the committee, presenters, participants and sponsors who have made extraordinary contributions to the success of this international conference. May Allah SWT, God Almighty, always bless all our reasonable efforts.

Jember, 20 November 2023
Rector of Universitas Jember
Dr. Ir. Iwan Taruna, M.Eng.IPM

Table of Content

| NO | TITLE | PAGE |
|-----|--|------|
| 1. | The Shackles of Patriarchy in Female Characters of The Barbie Film Galuh Gita Indrajayani, Daris Dzulfikar | 1 |
| 2. | Can Witches Be Powerful and Affectionate? A Reading of Fantasy Films Nurhadianty Rahayu | 11 |
| 3. | Participatory Action Research of Building Marital Rape Awareness in the Agrotourism Environment of Pronojiwo Village Muhammad Nasiruddin, Ade Rosi Siti Zakiah, Mufidah Ch | 17 |
| 4. | Gender Representation in Kurikulum Merdeka's EFL Textbook: A Critical Discourse Analysis Nauka Nayana Prasadini, Tri Winindyasari Palupi | 30 |
| 5. | Legalizing Prostitution Against Female Commercial Sex Workers (CSWs) In Bangladesh Isnindya Ramadhani Mamisa Putri, Sri Yuniati, Linda Dwi Eriyanti | 39 |
| 6. | Implementation of The CEDAW on Sexual Violence Through The Congress of Indonesia Women Ulama Wilda Aulia Maulida Afni, Linda Dwi Eriyanti, Fuat Albayumi | 53 |
| 7. | Forms of Gender Discrimination against Female Employees in Korea Nurin Nauvalia | 65 |
| 8. | Silenced Women's Voices in The God of Small Things: A Postcolonial Ecofeminist Analysis Nurul Lailatul Hasanah, Suci Suryani | 82 |
| 9. | Race Ecofeminism as Reflected in the Novel Their Eyes Were Watching God by Zora Neale Hurston Zumairoh, Suci Suryani | 92 |
| 10. | Sexual Violence Against Women in the Australian Parliament Alex Candra Adi Pratama, Linda Dwi Eriyanti, Himawan Bayu Patriadi | 104 |
| 11. | Analysis of Marketing Mix Strategies in Facing the Challenges of the Electric Cigarette or Vape Industry from a Gender Perspective Ardian Adriyadhi Suyadhi, Nurcahyaning Dwi Kusumaningrum, Abdul Mustofa Iqbal Asyrof, Farra Shayrani Rosadi | 117 |
| 12. | Increased Participation of Indonesian Female Peacekeepers in The United Nations Peacekeeping Mission in Lebanon (UNIFIL) Bernadeth Almathea Wulandari, Linda Dwi Eriyanti, Muhammad Hadi Makmur | 133 |
| 13. | Rape Culture Pictured In Barbara Dee's <i>Maybe He Just Likes You</i> Arnya Cahya Pertiwi, LDP Wardani, Reni Kusumaningputri, Dina Dyah Kusumayanti | 147 |
| 14. | The Role of Women Activists in Improving Environmental Conditions in Kenya | 160 |

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| | Cindy Yuliawatia, Linda Dwi Eriyanti, Adhiningasih Prabhawati | |
| 15. | The Representation of Women and Gender Injustice in Tenni Purwati's Short Story Sambal di Ranjang: A Liberal Feminism Study Fatmawati, Haikal Faqih, Erninda Puji Agustin, Tri Aprilia C.K., Febriyanti, Dwi Handayani | 171 |



Legalizing Prostitution Against Female Commercial Sex Workers (CSWs) In Bangladesh

Isnindya Ramadhani M.P^{1, b)}

Sri Yuniati^{2, c)}

Linda Dwi Eriyanti^{3, a)}

¹International Relations, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Jember

²International Relations, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Jember

³International Relations, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Jember

^{a)} Corresponding author: linda.fisip@unej.ac.id

^{b)} isnindyarmp@gmail.com

^{c)} sriyuniati.fisip@unej.ac.id

Abstract: This study aims to determine the causes of the legalization of prostitution's impact on female commercial Sex Workers (CSWs) in Bangladesh. As a country with a Muslim-majority population, Bangladesh has legalized prostitution since 2000. However, in practice, the legalization of prostitution harms the lives of female prostitutes. Data were collected from books, journals, reports, and online media related to this research topic. The study finds that legalizing prostitution in Bangladesh further strengthens Bangladesh's patriarchal culture and capitalism. In prostitution in Bangladesh, working as a prostitute gets a negative stigma from the community even though it has been legalized. At the same time, there is no negative stigma for men as service users. In addition, the legalization of prostitution strengthens the capitalist system in Bangladesh—the owners of capital and the state benefit from the practice of prostitution. The legalization of prostitution, which aims to protect female CSWs, is, in fact, even more oppressive to women. It has resulted in increased sexual and economic exploitation of female CSWs.

INTRODUCTION

The legalization of prostitution in a state institution often raises pros and cons. Legalizing prostitution has several forms. One form of legalization is decriminalizing prostitution service providers and prostitution clients. Bangladesh has legalized prostitution since 2000. This legalization was triggered by the forced closure of prostitution in 1999 at the Tanbazar and Nimtoli brothels, where 30 percent of all CSWs in Bangladesh, numbering more than 3,000 people. [1] This forced closure by the Police received attention from many human rights groups in Bangladesh. Many CSWs then did not find a place to live and became homeless after this incident.

Since 2000, the Bangladesh High Court has determined that prostitution is a legal livelihood and the expulsion of female CSWs from their workplaces is an illegal act. [2] It makes Bangladesh one of the countries with a Muslim majority where prostitution is legal. Through the

legalization of prostitution, female CSWs in Bangladesh have the legal right to carry out their work. Bangladesh only legalizes prostitution in registered brothels and CSWs who work individually and provides a minimum age limit of 18 years. This legalization is only permitted for women, while male CSWs are not legalized. Bangladeshi law also does not allow places such as hotels or streets to become places of prostitution. The procurement of women for prostitution is also prohibited under Bangladeshi law.

Even though prostitution has been legalized in Bangladesh, the facts show that female commercial CSWs still experience violence, and they cover up the violence they experience because they are under pressure from their place of prostitution. Apart from that, many female CSWs experience obstacles in reporting the violence they experience because the authorities have collaborated with brothel managers who only care about the wishes and satisfaction of clients. In brothels spread across several regions in Bangladesh, many underage female CSWs are also found, most of whom are victims of human trafficking. [3]

It cannot be denied that most international law provisions are formed through the male perspective. It is because the main subject of international law is the male power structure, namely states and international organizations. [4] The legal formation of a patriarchal culture or system will produce patriarchal rules. Patriarchy is not an imperfection in the system but is part of its structure and continuously reinforced by it. This research examines the issue of legalizing prostitution using a socialist feminist perspective.

METHOD

Socialist feminism, Patriarchy, and Capitalism

This research uses a qualitative descriptive method to describe, explain, explain, and answer the problems. The focus of the problem in this research is why the legalization of prostitution impacts female prostitutes in Bangladesh. In this study, the data collected was secondary data obtained from books, journals, reports, and online media. Socialist feminism is used in this study to analyze more comprehensively the problem of legalizing prostitution. It assumes that the source of the oppression experienced by women comes from patriarchal culture, which is strengthened by capitalism. In general, patriarchy is a system that positions men higher than women. Men have a higher position than women in all aspects of social, cultural, and economic life. [5]

Capitalism is an economic system characterized by private or corporate ownership of capital goods, investment determined by personal decisions, and prices, production, and distribution of goods determined primarily by competition in the free market. [6] According to socialist feminism, capitalism and patriarchy are not autonomous economic systems but are interdependent. However, patriarchy still precedes capitalism through the existence of a societal sexual order that derives from ideological and political interpretations of biological differences. For socialist feminists, historical materialism is defined in terms of relations of production by understanding its relationship to relations that arise from women's sexuality and reproductive

relations. The ideological formulation of this relationship is vital. An understanding of feminist materialism must lead us to understand the existence of women in a patriarchal capitalist society. [7]

RESULT

Female CSWs in Bangladesh experience contradictions in their lives. They consider their job 'bad' but also defend their right to work actively in Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). NGOs in Bangladesh have indeed had a positive impact, but female CSWs are still experiencing violence and harassment. It is because NGOs in Bangladesh believe that working as prostitutes is legitimate, and they focus on improving the condition of women by increasing a person's ability to make up their minds, make choices, and take considered actions. [8] In Bangladesh, providers of commercial sexual exploitation facilities use violence to control workers. Corrupt officials, the government, and the Police exploit prostitutes through extortion and violence. Female CSWs are also stigmatized in society, including in media reports, so it is difficult for them to reintegrate into the communities where they lived before. Prostitution in Bangladesh has been legalized since 2000, but there is no definite data from the government regarding the number of prostitutes in Bangladesh. Many say that the number of Female CSWs in Bangladesh is around 200,000. [9]The prostitutes are spread in various forms of prostitution, starting from prostitution in registered brothels, on the streets or in certain places (Floating CSWs), and in hotels (Hotel Workers). Floating CSWs usually contact their clients on the street or in certain areas that are already used. These Floating CSWs (FSW) prostitutes have sex with their clients wherever they can, such as in the park or sometimes in the client's house.

Meanwhile, Hotel Based CSWs (HBSW) meet and serve their clients in hotels, where hotel managers and other employees act as brokers or pimps. However, only prostitution in registered brothels or prostitution by individuals is legal in Bangladesh. Legalized prostitutes were also limited to women over 18, while men were still not legalized. Girls under the age of 18 are prohibited from becoming prostitutes in Bangladesh. Around 11 Brothels are operating in Bangladesh.[10] The Brothel is a registered brothel or quasi-legal Brothel, which means that the prostitutes in the Brothel already have formal documents to become prostitutes. Formal documents were obtained from the first-level court where the names of prostitutes who entered the Brothel were registered. However, formal documents for entering prostitution did not exist in any formal law in Bangladesh. However, the practice of using these licensing documents is still ongoing today, and even though the Brothel is under the supervision of the authorities, there is no guarantee of adequate protection for Female CSWs in the Brothel.

Apart from prostitutes who work in Brothel, some prostitutes work outside Brothel. Although Bangladesh Hotel and Residence CSWs are illegal, this prostitution is still widely practiced in Bangladesh, especially in Dhaka. According to official statistics, there were 19,384 women engaged as CSWs in Dhaka, of which 8,238 were street-based CSWs, 8,798 were residential-based CSWs, and 2,348 were hotel-based CSWs. [11] The prostitutes based outside

the quasi-legal Brothel primarily run the prostitution business clandestinely. It is because in Bangladesh's formal law, "CSWs are also arrested for soliciting in public under public nuisance offenses (s.290 of Penal Code)" (s. 290 KUHP). Police also arrest CSWs without a warrant under 'suspicious' conditions (s.54 of the Code of Criminal Procedure 1898) (Article 54 of the Criminal Procedure Code 1898). In the Criminal or Bangladesh penal codes, the Police are often misused to extort CSWs. CSWs based in hotels and residences mostly have a double identity to trick the authorities. They realize that it is not only the authorities who often extort them in the name of the law but also people with upheld values in their social environment who think working as a prostitute is a terrible job. These prostitutes usually wear regular clothes and often use other occupational identities to cover up their work as prostitutes.

The prostitutes outside the quasi-legal Brothel also experienced much violence but remained silent. The silence of these prostitutes is not because of a hierarchy like what happened in Brothel but because of the social stigma. These prostitutes have many fears and fear rejection by their families, society, and the legal justice system. According to research conducted by Shelwy, several of the study's respondents were hotel-based and resident CSWs who experienced violent attacks and tried to report them to the Police. However, their reports were rejected. [12] There was once a case of murder by the husband of a prostitute who also worked in an NGO. None of the prostitute's friends reported the murder because they feared their work would be exposed and did not want their friend to be insulted after her death.

Economic and Sexual Exploitation of Female CSWs in Bangladesh

Before the legalization of prostitution, prostitutes in Bangladesh worked underground. They work to prevent the authorities from being criminalized, as well as brothel and madam landowners. They are exploited economically and sexually by madams and their clients. However, this exploitation is not supported by legality or recognition from the state. The authorities also exploited before legalization by carrying out evictions or asking for bribes. With legalization, these prostitutes are increasingly experiencing more exploitation, including from the state. Legalization specifically for women also has an extraordinary impact on women because it will strengthen women's vulnerability in Bangladesh's patriarchal society.

1. Increasing Debt Bondage Practices in Brothels in Bangladesh

The practice of prostitution in brothels is legal in Bangladesh. The Brothel is a complex or area used for prostitution. In Bangladesh, there are several brothels with thousands of female prostitutes. There are approximately 11 brothels that are still active and registered as quasi-legal brothels, including brothels based in Jessore, Bagerhat, Fultala, Mongla (Baniasanta), Patuakhali, Madaripur, Faridpur Sadar (Rothkhola Brothel), C&B Ghat, Mymensingh Sadar, Tangail Sadar and Amalpur Sadar. [13] Most of these brothels have been built since the time of the British occupation of Bangladesh. The UK transformed prostitution in South Asia by moving female CSWs to enclaves such as Kandapara and establishing Red Districts in cities. [14] The brothels continued to operate after the British left the South Asian region in 1947 and provided services

to local customers and lucrative leases to landlords. Brothels in Bangladesh are mostly located along the major rivers that flow from the Himalayas to the Bay of Bengal, one of which is the Kandapara Brothel. The Kandapara Brothel was built on three hectares of land along the Louhajang River and became an important entertainment venue for zamindars (landlords) during the British Empire in Bangladesh. [15] However, there were also those built near the railway line, such as Brothel Daulatdia, which was also built during the British Empire.

Female CSWs who wish to enter the Brothel legally must hold a first-class Magistrate/Public Notary's license under a written statement that they are working in the Brothel of their own free will and are over eighteen years of age [16] These licenses are mostly given to girls under 18 years of age. Officials work with informal brokers who sell girls under 18 to obtain licenses, and the authorities take advantage of falsifying this age. The newcomer CSW is called Chukri, an underage girl who is sold to Sardani. These Chukris are then attached to the Sardani or Madam who has purchased them. The income of the Chukris will also be given to Sardani until it reaches the amount of money, they used to buy the girl. This Madam will provide room, food, and clothes. Chukri can 'buy' his freedom and independence after they repay Sardani's investment in him. To gain freedom or independence, these prostitutes must go through negotiations which are carried out in 'shalis' or local meetings. This practice is known as debt bondage.

Debt Bondage became the beginning of exploitation carried out in the Brothel hierarchy. Debt bondage occurs when someone is forced to work to pay off debt. They are conned into working for little or no pay, with no control over their debts. [17] Under Sardanis or Madam, female prostitutes in Brothel had to work without pay for an indefinite amount of time until their 'debt' was paid off. Labonni, a 19-year-old prostitute at Brothel Mymensinghs, said that in the six years she worked as a prostitute (since she was 13), she had earned more than £46,500. However, all the proceeds were given to his Madam. Labonni only gets £37 monthly allowance to buy food, clothing, and toiletries. Labonni had to return his 'loan money,' only £ 914 to be 50 times. Even when the debt is cleared, she must pay half of her weekly income, or around £78, to the madams in exchange for electricity and accommodation. [18]

In 2020, when the pandemic hit people almost all over the world, including Bangladesh, female prostitutes in Bangladeshi brothels had to face even more difficult times. On March 20, 2020, the government of Bangladesh announced that it would close around 12 legal brothels in Bangladesh until at least April 5, 2020, including one of the largest brothels in the world, Daulatdia. [19] The closure was then extended to April 14, 2020. Their problems increased; apart from being exploited, they also experienced hunger. Reduced clients who come to the Brothel make their income is also reduced.

Moreover, most of their customers are truck drivers who deliver goods between regions, and during the pandemic, the delivery of goods was restricted. Before the pandemic, approximately 3,000 men came to the Brothel every day. During the pandemic, the number of clients who came were drastically reduced. Prostitutes working to support their families at home or their children outside the Brothel cannot send money. Even prostitutes who have children in

“Feminist Theory and Practice: Efforts to Maintain Human Values”

Center of Gender Studies, Universitas Jember, Indonesia

brothels cannot afford to buy diapers for their children. This pandemic period has also made it increasingly difficult for prostitutes in brothels to pay their 'debt' to Madam. Their exploitation is getting longer due to this pandemic. When interviewed by CNN, Shurovi, one of the female CSWs in Daulatdia, said that she did not get income and could not support her family. There was not enough help from the government. It was as if we had died before we died. [20]

Before the legalization of prostitution, debt bondage was carried out based on the money the Madam spent on the broker or person who sold the female prostitute. After the legalization of prostitution, this flow of debt bondage increased because the Chukri had to pay bribes to obtain licenses and guarantee the 'safety' of their licenses. These payments are usually made by brokers and prostitutes, most of whom are victims of human trafficking and do not know anything about the exact amount. Brokers, of course, still want to make a profit, so the purchase money for women who are victims of human trafficking is high. Debt Bondage is a form of economic and sexual exploitation that worsened after legalization was implemented.

Legalizing prostitution in Bangladesh does not only apply to female prostitutes who work in brothels but also allows female prostitutes to work privately or individually. However, prostitutes based outside brothels have a high vulnerability to criminalization. The legal ambiguity in Bangladesh makes many prostitutes outside Brothel very careful in carrying out their work because they are very prone to being targeted by police officers in the name of law. These laws in Bangladesh even support the social stigma related to female CSWs. One of the frequent occurrences of Bangladeshi law that reinforces social stigma is that the Police refuse to take cases of female CSWs if their professional identity is revealed, referring to them as 'public women.' [21] However, these police officers often make arrests using the laws in Bangladesh, such as Section 290 of the Penal Code, which states that soliciting (offering/asking to sell sex) is illegal. The Metropolitan Police Act (MPA, 1976), implemented in 6 urban districts in Bangladesh, also states that it is forbidden to solicit other people in public spaces for prostitution. In one of the urban districts in Bangladesh, Dhaka, there are regulations written in section 74 of the Dhaka Metropolitan Police Act, 1976, which regulates punishment related to soliciting prostitution. This law regulates the imposition of sanctions on any person who, on the street or any public place or within sight of any street or public place, whether from inside a house or building or not, asks or attracts the attention of other people (in words: obscene words, gestures, or actions) for prostitution, can be punished with imprisonment and a fine. [22]

Prostitutes outside the Brothel are also often subject to regulations regarding vagrancy, which are written in Section 2(7) of the Vagrancy Act 1943, which defines a vagrant as a person who remains in a public place and has no actual means of subsistence or no place to stay. The provisions follow it in section 4 of the Law, which states that any police officer can arrest anyone who appears homeless without a warrant. That person can also be detained in a Home for the Homeless on a judge's order. Many prostitutes are illegally placed in homeless homes. It is worth noting in this context that in 2015, the Ministry of Law, Justice, and Parliamentary Affairs (MoLJPA) of Bangladesh noted that prostitutes do not fall within the definition of vagrancy under the Vagrancy Act. In Section 290 of the Penal Code (Violations Affecting Public Health,

Safety, Comfort, Morals and Morals), it is stipulated that anyone who commits a public disorder in any case that this regulation cannot punish will be punished with a fine, which can be extended to two hundred takas. [23] This regulation gives the Police the freedom to impose punishments 'subjectively.' The various regulations in Bangladesh do not pay attention in detail to the consequences that can occur to women. Bangladesh's strong culture of patriarchy and capitalism means that the legal regulations implemented do not consider women and even further oppress women. Legalizing prostitution gives patriarchal and corrupt officials in Bangladesh more power to oppress female prostitutes by taking advantage of their helplessness.

2. Access for female CSWs to report violence is increasingly difficult.

The madams did everything they could so that the capital they spent buying female CSWs could return and make a profit. Not caring about the condition of the prostitutes, the madams only care about how to get as many clients as possible so they can get much profit. Chukri in brothels in Bangladesh are forced to take steroid pills to make their bodies look mature. Madam used to tell them that the pills were essential to keep them strong and healthy. Hashi, a prostitute in Brothel Kandapara who also has a 4-year-old child who lives with relatives outside Brothel and whom he has not met in the last two years, said in an interview with Reuters, "Sardani/Madam, I forced myself to take pills (oradexon), he beat me and stopped feeding me and reminded me about my loan (debt bondage)." Hashi also said, "At this Brothel, customers are always looking for 'healthy' girls. I consume Oradexon because I need customers to pay my bills and loans; if I do not get customers one day, I cannot eat the next day. I also want to save money for my child." [24] Like Hashi, many female CSWs ultimately choose to take oradexon (a type of steroid pill usually used as fattening cattle) to become 'fatter' and get more clients so that their debts can be paid off quickly. They can be free. [25] They seemed to think of nothing but getting money and being able to eat that day. Kali, a female prostitute at Brothel Daulatdia who has been a prostitute for 15 years and takes Oradexon, said that many of her friends have died from the pill, one of whom is named Doly. "I do not care if this pill kills me, as long as I can live my life". [26]

3. Stigma and Discrimination against CSWs in Bangladesh

Female CSWs are badly stigmatized by society, which results in them being discriminated against in Bangladeshi society. They are marginalized, and even their presence is rejected by society. When women enter the prostitution industry, it is difficult for them to re-enter society. This discrimination has implications for the vulnerability of female CSWs. They are highly vulnerable to their reproductive health. These sexual and reproductive health (SRH) problems include unwanted pregnancies, abortions, maternal health problems, and sexually transmitted infections (STIs) [27] Amid health vulnerabilities owned by female prostitutes, they also experience obstacles in accessing health services.

Causes of Oppression Experienced by CSWs In Bangladesh

Although prostitution was later legalized, conditions for female CSWs did not improve. One study estimated that as many as 100,000 women and girls work in the country's sex industry, and another study reported that less than 10% of those who enter prostitution do so voluntarily. The investigation also uncovered hundreds of girls who spoke about being sold by strangers, family members, or husbands without their consent. [28] These women are exploited by their families or those closest to them because of economic factors and women's position, which is seen as lower than men. The legalization of prostitution, which was hoped to provide changes towards a better life for prostitutes, has not been proven. Patriarchal culture and the development of capitalism are the main factors causing this.

1. Patriarchal culture in Bangladesh

Bangladesh's patriarchal culture impacts female CSWs even though prostitution has been legalized. Bangladeshi society still adheres to a solid patriarchal culture. When there is an option to provide for both boys and girls, boys will likely receive better food, clothing, and care. [29] Including in sexual matters, men's physical needs are placed at the forefront of the discourse on gender rights and used as a justification for prostitution.

One form of patriarchal tradition that is still preserved in Bangladesh is dowry (gift money) at weddings. Dowry is property, money, jewelry, or any other form of wealth received by a man or a man's family from a wife or a woman's family at the time of marriage. [30] In the view of Bangladeshi society, dowry can improve the status of women in marriage so that women will be more respected in their marriage. If the woman cannot fulfill the requested dowry, the man will resort to much violence, including murder, commonly known as bride burning. [31] According to Odhikar, a human rights body in Bangladesh, from 2001 to 2017, as many as 5,699 women experienced dowry-related violence, and the rate of murder and suicide due to dowry incidents was also high. [32] Women who live in poverty will be very burdened by this tradition. However, not getting married is also not an option for women in Bangladesh because society has the idea that girls should be married off at an early age for the happiness of their families and to enable them to learn household duties and responsibilities. A father in a Bangladeshi family still thinks that getting his daughter married is the main task in his life. A father, who is often the sole decision-maker in a family in Bangladesh, often arranges the marriage of teenage girls without consulting his children or even his wife. [33]

The patriarchal culture developed in Bangladeshi society is manifested in the policy of legalizing prostitution, specifically for women only. This legalization specifically impacts the group of female CSWs. Women entering the realm of prostitution as CSWs is considered normal, while for men, it is the opposite. The role of men in the prostitution industry in Bangladesh has long been chiefly as clients who use the services of CSWs. Legalizing prostitution in Bangladesh makes men freer to purchase sexual services. They only need to come to a registered brothel or CSWs who do it privately and have a license; then, they will be safe. This condition impacts female CSWs, who are increasingly oppressed by the freedom of these men.

The license of female CSWs in Bangladeshi prostitution does not include protection for women. Instead, this legalization protects buyers and managers of sex services because they are no longer criminalized. Finally, police officers in Bangladesh take advantage of many female CSWs through age falsification, bribery of supervision, and using other laws, such as the Section 290 Penal Code, to criminalize CSWs who are considered to have offered themselves on the streets. These arrests are only based on the subjective views of the police officers on duty. Most police personnel in Bangladesh are men. As of January 2021, there were 15,163 female police personnel in Bangladesh, which is only 7.92% of the total personnel, which means that more than 90% of Bangladeshi police personnel are male. [34] From this explanation, prostitution laws in Bangladesh favor men more and place CSWs in increasingly oppressed conditions. The state gives them legitimacy and protection to buy sex to supervise CSWs, but the regulations for protecting female CSWs are inadequate. It shows that this legal regulation perpetuates patriarchal culture by giving greater power to men, both as clients, managers, and supervisors.

2. Development Of Capitalism in Bangladesh

Capitalism in Bangladesh also influences the impact of legalizing prostitution. Since 1975, Bangladesh has issued the Revised Investment Policy (1975), which focuses on solid development in the private sector and is based on an export-oriented economic growth strategy. The aim is to reduce the budget deficit and inflation, increase domestic savings and encourage long-term growth. [35] The freedom given to the private sector makes Bangladesh a suitable ground for the development of capitalism. Data from the World Bank in 2018 shows that around 22 million Bangladeshis still live below the poverty line. [36]

This condition is one of the impacts of capitalism in the Bangladesh economy, which gives the private sector great control over the country's economy and makes profits only accrue to those who own the means of production. The prostitution industry, which is also a significant industry in Bangladesh, operates like a business in general, which relies on demand and supply factors. Legalizing prostitution makes things easier for capitalism in the prostitution industry in Bangladesh. Capital owners in the prostitution industry are safer running their businesses because the state has recognized them. Brothel owners and managers have more freedom in oppressing female CSWs because they are legally protected from the threat of closure. Clients also feel safer from arrest if they purchase the services of underage female CSWs who work in brothels because legally, they already have a license (even if it is fake), so their age is written down in the law.

Legalizing prostitution strengthens the collaboration of patriarchy and capitalism in Bangladesh, namely by only establishing licensing regulations for legalization without reasonable protective regulations. Licensing without protection only provides legitimacy for those in power to oppress. Many female CSWs are exploited by trapping them in debt (debt bondage). [37] The profits of capital owners are the main thing, while the welfare of female CSWs is not considered. It was apparent when the COVID-19 pandemic occurred. After approximately 20 years of their work being legalized, the lives of female CSWs in Bangladesh were still far from prosperous. They

experience a lot of violence and poverty. The collaborative circle of patriarchy and capitalism increasingly oppresses female CSWs. The legalization of prostitution does not provide special protection for female CSWs, but the legalization regulations only recognize employment status.

3. Collaboration of Patriarchy and Capitalism in Bangladesh, which Oppresses Women

Bangladesh's patriarchal culture and rapid growth of capitalism create conditions that oppress women. Discussions related to capitalism in the view of socialist feminism cannot be separated from the existence of patriarchy. According to the view of socialist feminism, which combines thoughts from Marxist feminism and radical feminism, families under the capitalist system can strengthen oppression against women. The family provides productive labour to supply market needs, but it should be noted that women are in a powerless position in the capitalist system. Of course, this is influenced by patriarchal values. The powerlessness of women under the capitalist system is rooted in four things: production, reproduction, sexuality, and socialization of children. Its biological capacities serve as the basis for defining its social and economic goals. Motherhood, for example, has become a concept for a family as a need that has existed for generations. The family has become a 'women's world'. However, this causes women to be marginalized from the production sector, ultimately resulting in sexual inequality. Power in the public sphere is held by men, which means that women are often only exploited. However, this does not mean that eliminating the family will solve this. The problems of capitalism are more than just family problems. They are a significant political system that includes many actors.

Economic inequality due to mastery of capital by capitalists makes many Bangladeshis live in poverty and oppression. The condition of Bangladesh with high poverty rates makes the condition of women in Bangladesh even more vulnerable. The capitalist system that runs with a patriarchal system makes men hold more power in both sexual and economic aspects. Therefore, the existence of women in poverty will increasingly place women in conditions that are vulnerable to being used as commodities for other people's economic interests. One prominent form is the dowry tradition in Bangladesh. The dowry tradition at weddings in Bangladesh is not only a form of culture but is used for profit. Men in Bangladesh use the momentum of marriage to gain sexual and material benefits. They get a wife and, at the same time, get a dowry from the bride. If the women cannot fulfil the dowry requested, the men often commit violence by killing (bride burning). Of course, women who live in poverty will be very burdened by this tradition. However, not getting married is also not an option for women in Bangladesh because they will be pressured by the social stigma that considers women imperfect if they are not married and have children.

The patriarchal-capitalist conditions in Bangladesh certainly influence decision-making regarding various regulations implemented in Bangladesh. Underlining that patriarchal culture in a patriarchal capitalist system shows power relations at a specific societal moment. Therefore, various rules made in a patriarchal capitalist system have implications for forming rules that perpetuate the system. The patriarchal-capitalist condition of Bangladesh certainly influences how considerations are taken in making a policy decision. The legalization of prostitution in

“Feminist Theory and Practice: Efforts to Maintain Human Values”

Center of Gender Studies, Universitas Jember, Indonesia

Bangladesh in 2000 was carried out following demands from 200 female prostitutes who became homeless following evictions by the authorities in 1996. These evictions were deemed to violate human rights, and female prostitutes were then given the right to work as prostitutes with specific regulations. If we pay attention, this legalization was carried out after there were demands related to economic factors. The female prostitutes who become homeless lose their livelihoods. They find it difficult to find other work amidst their bad stigma in society. Bangladesh then provided a solution by legalizing it, which indirectly could also mean that because there were no other employment options that the state could provide amidst the patriarchal conditions in Bangladesh, finally, women were allowed to be recognized by the state as property in capitalism through their sexuality. The government of Bangladesh even collects taxes from prostitutes but does not protect them.

Various forms of exploitation and violence in brothels in Bangladesh are a form of collaboration between patriarchy and capitalism. Female prostitutes are exploited by ensnaring them in debt (debt bondage). They have not even been paid for years. The profits of the capital holders, namely madams and landowners, are the main thing, while the welfare of the prostitutes is not included in the consideration. Madams and landowners must bribe the authorities for the security of their brothels, such as to keep them safe from arrest for drug trafficking and to cover up reports of violence. The authorities then made false reports on the surveillance they carried out, including falsifying the ages of the female prostitutes in the Brothel. The black circle continues to turn into a chain that oppresses female prostitutes.

CONCLUSION

Legalizing prostitution in Bangladesh is carried out because of the interests of the patriarchal and capitalist systems. Legalizing prostitution further strengthens men's power because it legalizes power and sexuality. Female CSWs are under the power of men as clients. After the legalization of prostitution, power over female CSWs is held by male clients and the state. The state legalizes the objectification of women in prostitution and takes many material benefits from female CSWs.

It is reflected in the policy of legalizing prostitution in Bangladesh, which is only a form of licensing for women to enter prostitution and a form of decriminalization for capital owners in prostitution. Therefore, legality regulations only benefit managers and supervisory officials, while female CSWs are increasingly oppressed.

REFERENCES

1. Hoque, E. The Right to be Human: The Dilemmas of Rights-Based Programming at CARE-Bangladesh. 1999.
2. Sex Workers Network (SWN), Bangladesh and Sex Workers and Allies in South Asia (SWASA), Bangladesh Chapter Submission. 2016

3. Wright, R. & Saeed, S. She Was Tricked as A Teen into Prostitution. A Decade On, She Has No Work and Faces Starvation. CNN. 2020. <https://edition.cnn.com/2020/05/26/asia/daulatdia-bangladesh-brothel-asequals-intl/index.html>
4. Debecker, L. To what extent is a gender bias in international law responsible for the failure to adequately address victims of sexual violence in conflict? In Global Campus of Human Rights Global Campus of Human Rights. 2019. No. 18211
5. Israpil, I. Budaya Patriarki dan Kekerasan Terhadap Perempuan (Sejarah dan Perkembangannya). Pusaka. 2017. <https://doi.org/10.31969/pusaka.v5i2.176>
6. Merriam-Webster. Capitalism. merriam-webster.com. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/capitalism>. n.d.-a.
7. Eisenstein, Z. R. Capitalist Patriarchy and the Case for Socialist Feminism. 1979.
8. Jennings, B., Cree, V. E., & Kirkwood, S. Agency and Exploitation: Two Sides of One Coin? Women's Experiences of Selling Sex And Engaging with NGOs in Dhaka. 2020. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0020872820959371>
9. Murray, F. Theminiulle, S. Ahmed, F. & Sadat, S. Study on Modern Slavery in Bangladesh. August. 2019.
10. Jahan, S. Bangladesh Vaccinates Sex Workers at Largest Brothel. The Jakarta Post. 2021. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/seasia/2021/02/25/bangladesh-vaccinates-sex-workers-at-largest-brothel.html>
11. Shewly, H. J., Nencel, L., Bal, E., & Sinha-Kerkhoff, K. Invisible mobilities: stigma, immobilities, and female sex workers' mundane socio-legal negotiations of Dhaka's urban space. Mobilities; Routledge. 2020. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17450101.2020.1739867>
12. Shewly, et.al. 2020
13. Sattar, D. M. P. Sex, Work and Sex-Work: The Clandestine Tale of a Tabooed Industry in Bangladesh. SSRN Electronic Journal. 2021. 1-34. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3768894>
14. Ahsan, A., & Redfern, C. This Woman is Fighting to Save Bangladesh's Oldest Brothel. Fullerproject.org. 2021. <https://fullerproject.org/story/women-trafficked-brothel-bangladesh/>
15. Chowdhury, S. T. Bangladesh Sex Workers Homeless After Brothel Eviction. Aljazeera.com. 2014. <https://www.aljazeera.com/features/2014/10/9/bangladesh-sex-workers-homeless-after-brothel-eviction>
16. Sattar, D.M.P. 2021
17. Anti-slavery. What is bonded labour? antislavery.org. <https://www.antislavery.org/slavery-today/bonded-labour/>:textDebt bondage occurs when a, original sum of money borrowed. n.d.
18. Redfern, C. The Living Hell of Young Girls Enslaved In Bangladesh's Brothels. The Guardian. 2019. <https://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2019/jul/06/living-hell-of-bangladesh-brothels-sex-trafficking>

19. Qantara.de. Bangladesh Vows Help to Sex Workers Hit By Coronavirus For as long as Needed. en.kantara.de. 2020. <https://en.qantara.de/content/bangladesh-vows-help-to-sex-workers-hit-by-coronavirus-for-as-long-as-needed>
20. CNN. Brothel in Lockdown Leaves Hundreds of Sex Workers Hungry. 2020. <https://edition.cnn.com/videos/world/2020/05/25/bangladesh-brothel-as-equals-intl.cnn>
21. Shewly, et.al. 2020
22. Sattar, D.M.P. 2021
23. Sattar, D.M.P. 2021
24. Biraj, A. Bangladesh’s “Teenage” Brothels Hold Dark Steroid Secret. Reuters.com. (2012). <https://www.reuters.com/article/bangladesh-prostitution-idINDEE82I04I20120319>
25. Sarkar, J. Prostitution and Male Perspectives : A Study on Sex Work and Violent Sexual Exploitation in Bangladesh. 2014.
26. Mesmin, D. Bangladesh: The Prostitute of Daulatdia. Arte Documentary. 2020. https://youtu.be/EvEk_FMXWzg
27. Wahed, T., Alam, A., Sultana, S., Rahman, M., Alam, N., Martens, M., & Somrongthong, R. Barriers to sexual and reproductive healthcare services as experienced by female sex workers and service providers in Dhaka city, Bangladesh. PLoS ONE. 2017. 12(7), 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0182249>
28. Redfern. 2019
29. Sarkar, J. 2014.
30. Tushi, N. H. Dowry Practices in Bangladesh, and India. April 2021.
31. Chowdhury, S. T. 2014.
32. The Business Standard. Tortured for dowry, Netrakona’s Teen Pregnant Mother Ends Life. 2021. <https://www.tbsnews.net/bangladesh/tortured-dowry-netrakona-teenpregnant-mother-ends-life-316198>
33. Farhana, T. “Girls are old at 20”: The social pressure behind child marriage in Bangladesh. Girls Not Bride. 2012. <https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/articles/girls-become-old-when-they-turn-20-the-social-pressure-behind-childmarriage-in-bangladesh>
34. Amin, N., & Chowdhury, Z. Women in Police: Participation Increases, but Not Responsibilities. The Business Standard. 2021. <https://www.tbsnews.net/women/empowerment/women-police/participation-increases-not/responsibilities-212659>
35. Rizky, Lucitania, H., & Chusnul. Kebijakan Industrialisasi Bangladesh dalam Menarik Investasi Asing Sebagai Dampak Kebijakan Neoliberalisme. Jurnal Transborder. 2020. 3(2), 60-72
36. The World Bank. Bangladesh: Reducing Poverty and Sharing Prosperity. Worldbank.org. 2018. <https://www.worldbank.org/en/results/2018/11/15/bangladesh-reducing->

poverty-and-sharing-prosperity:text=While the income growth%2C human,living below the poverty line.

37. Islam, A., & Smyth, R. The Economic Returns to Good Looks and poverty-and-sharingprosperity#: ~:text=While the income growth%2C human,living below the poverty line. 2012.





Anggota APPTI No. 002.115.1.05.2020

Anggota IKAPI No. 127/JTI/2018

Jember University Press
Jl. Kalimantan 37 Jember 68121
Telp. 0331-330224. psw. 0319
E-mail: upt-penerbitan@unej.ac.id

