JSEAHR

JOURNAL OF SOUTHEAST ASIAN HUMAN RIGHTS

Volume 6 | Issue 2

Indexed By

Scopus

A production of:

abubakarebyhara

JSEAHR²

ANNOUNCEMENTS   CURRENT   ARCHIVES   ABOUT ▾

[Search field]   **Search**

ISSN: 2599-2147

Editor-in-Chief: Dr. Al Khanif - *The Centre for Human Rights, Multiculturalism and Migration (CHRM2) University of Jember*

The Journal of Southeast Asian Human Rights (JSEAHR) editorial board welcomes articles for review and publication consideration. JSEAHR is an open-access journal that does not charge any fees for authors or institutional subscriptions as part of its effort to disseminate human rights knowledge for readers. JSEAHR is the flagship academic publication of the University of Jember's Centre for Human Rights, Multiculturalism and Migration (CHRM2) and the Indonesian Consortium for Human Rights Lecturers (SEPAHAM Indonesia). The journal provides a platform for human rights analysis from various perspectives that welcome empirical, interdisciplinary, and doctrinal approaches to exploring the historical and recent situation of human rights in Southeast Asia and beyond.

PUBLISHED: 2022-12-31

Front Cover

PDF

EDITORIAL

ARTICLES

Struggling with Development

Mirza Satria Buana

226-249

📄 PDF

The Right to Education for Ethnic Minority Women and Girls in Vietnam

Nguyen Thi Hong Yen, Do Qui Hoang

250-276

📄 PDF

Disruptions and Corporate Human Rights Responsibility

Stefanus Mere, Otto Gusti Ndedong Madung

277-298

📄 PDF

Centering Acculturation as an Approach to Challenging the Fragility of Human Rights in Indonesia

Maksimus Regus

299-322

📄 PDF

Back Cover

📄 PDF

MAKE A SUBMISSION

Author Guidelines

Editorial Board

Focus and Scope

Formatting Style Sheet

Download Journal Template

Screening for Plagiarism

Publication Ethics

Publishing System

Open Access Policy

Copyright

Indexing and Abstracting

Contact Us

References Tools

INDEXED BY

Scopus

HEINONLINE

sinta
Science and Technology Index

Visitor Statistics

Visitors

ID 39,905	MY 748	AU 430
PH 5,332	VN 503	GB 416
US 4,446	IN 482	
FR 1,050	SG 459	

Pageviews: 109,697

See more ▶

FLAG counter

Counted since August 3, 2020

RECENT ISSUES

- Volume 4, Issue 1, 2020
- Volume 4, Issue 2, 2020
- Volume 5, Issue 1, 2021
- Volume 5, Issue 2, 2021
- Volume 6. Issue 1, 2022

JOURNAL CONTENT

Search

Search Scope

All

SEARCH

BROWSE

By Issue

By Author

By Title

Other Journals

INDEXED BY

Scopus

HEINONLINE

sinta
Science and Technology Index

INFORMATION

For Readers

For Authors

For Librarians

University of Jember

JurnalUNEJ

abubakarebyhara

JSEAHR²

ANNOUNCEMENTS   CURRENT   ARCHIVES   ABOUT ▾

Search

Beyond the Global Agenda

State and Religious Non-state Actors' Responses to Human Security in Indonesia

Abubakar Eby Hara

International Relations Department, University of Jember, Indonesia

ⓘD http://orcid.org/0000-0002-0952-0198

Suyani Indriastuti

International Relations Department, University of Jember, Indonesia

ⓘD http://orcid.org/0000-0001-9084-0836

Agus Trihartono

International Relations Department, University of Jember, Indonesia

ⓘD http://orcid.org/0000-0002-2817-6652

ABSTRACT

This article examines how state and religious non-state actors understand and make efforts to overcome human security challenges in Indonesia. The activities of these actors are largely outside the UNDP global human security agenda because they have been conducted long before the concept of human security was popularised. The authors seek to reinterpret the concept of human security as a paradigm to make it more attuned to the experience of the state and religious non-state actors when dealing with human security

challenges in the Indonesian context. Data from primary and secondary sources gathered in Indonesia in 2021 reveals that religious motivations and environmental threats drive the agendas of religious non-state actors operating in Indonesia.

REFERENCES

Alexandra, Lina A, "Perceptions on Human Security: An Indonesian View" in Yoichi Mine, Oscar A Gómez & Ako Muto, eds, Hum Secur Norms East Asia (Palgrave Macmillan, 2019) 67.

Alkire, Sabina, A Conceptual Framework for Human Security, by Sabina Alkire, 2 (Oxford, 2003).

Anggoro, Kusnanto, Keamanan Nasional, Pertahanan Negara dan Ketertiban Umum (Bappenas, 2003).

Arnez, Monika, "Empowering Women Through Islam: Fatayat NU Between Tradition and Change" (2010) 21:1 J Islam Stud 59–88, online: .

Baras, Ahmad & Muhammad Fakrudin, "Penolakan Simbol Islam di Bali | Republika Online", Republika (29 August 2014), online: .

Barton, Greg, "The Gülen Movement, Muhammadiyah and Nahdlatul Ulama: Progressive Islamic Thought, Religious Philanthropy and Civil Society in Turkey and Indonesia, Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations" (2014) 25:3 Islam Christ Relations 287–301, online: .

Bayu, Dimas, "Sebanyak 86,9% Penduduk Indonesia Beragama Islam", (16 February 2022), online: Kemendagri .

Fauzia, Amelia, "Penolong Kesengsaraan Umum: The charitable activism of Muhammadiyah during the colonial period" (2017) 25:4 https://doi.org/101177/0967828X17740458 379–394, online: .

Fitrah, Elpeni, "Gagasan Human Security Dan Kebijakan Keamanan Nasional Indonesia" (2015) 2:01 Insign J Int Relations 27–41, online: .

Fuad, Muhammad, "Civil Society in Indonesia: The Potential and Limits of Muhammadiyah" (2002) 17:2 Sojourn J Soc Issues Southeast Asia 133–163, online: .

Grim, Brian J & Roger Finke, "Religious Persecution in Cross-National Context: Clashing Civilizations or Regulated Religious Economies?" (2016) 72:4 https://doi.org/101177/000312240707200407 633–658, online: .

Hadiwinata, Bob, "Poverty and the role of ngos in protecting human security in indonesia" (2017) Non-Traditional Secur Asia Dilemmas Secur 198–224, online: .

Hanlon, Robert J & Kenneth Christie, Freedom from Fear, Freedom from Want: An Introduction to Human Security (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016).

Hasudungan, Michael, "Pengaturan Penyiaran Agama di Indonesia dalam Perspektif Keadilan Bermartabat" (2020) 4:1 J Ilmu Huk Aleth 57–74, online: .

Hijazi, H Ahmad, "ISLAMIC EDUCATION in INDONESIA DURING the DUTCH COLONIAL; The Case Muhammadiyah and NU" (2011) 1:2 Madania J Ilmu-Ilmu Keislam 202–223, online: .

Honna, Jun, "Japan and the Responsibility to Protect: coping with human security diplomacy" (2012) 25:1 https://doi.org/101080/095127482011632968 95–112, online: .

Joram, Tarusarira & Ezra Chitando, Themes in Religion and Human Security in Africa, Tarusarira Joram & Ezra Chitando, eds (ROUTLEDGE, 2022).

Julio, Claudia F Fuentes & Hans Günter Brauch, "The Human Security Network: A Global North-South Coalition BT - Facing Global Environmental Change: Environmental, Human, Energy, Food, Health and Water Security Concepts" in Hans Günter Brauch et al, eds, (Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 2009) 991.

Kaldor, Mary, "NATO and human security" (2022) 1 NDC Policy Br (NDC Policy Brief) 1–4, online: .

Khanif, Al, Religious minorities, Islam, and the law: international human rights and Islamic law in Indonesia, 1st ed (Routledge, 2020).

Kuswaraharja, Dadan, "Kemenag: Wisata Halal Bukan Islamisasi Wisata", DetikTravel (21 November 2021), online: .

Latief, Hilman, "Philanthropy and 'Muslim Citizenship' in Post-Suharto Indonesia" (2016) 5:2 Southeast Asian Stud 269–286.

Latif, Yudi, "Keamanan Insani", Republika Online (29 August 2012), online: .

Lombardi, Clark B & Jr, James Wellman, "Introduction: Religion and Human Security: An Understudied Relationship" in Clark B Lombardi & James Wellman, eds, Introd Relig Hum Secur An Understudied Relatsh (2012) James K Wellman, Jr Clark B Lomb eds, Relig Hum Secur A Glob Perspect (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012) 1.

Makin, Al, "Haji Omar Said Tjokroaminoto: Islam and Socialism (Indonesia, 1924/1963)" in Björn Bentlage et al, eds, Relig Dyn under Impact Imp Colon (Brill, 2017) 249.

Mine, Yoichi, Oscar A Gómez & Ako Muto, "Human Security in East Asia: Assembling a Puzzle" (2019) Hum Secur Norms East Asia 1–22.

Muto, Ako, "Human Security Norms in East Asia: Towards Conceptual and Operational Innovation – CESRAN International" (2020) 8:1 J Confl Transform Secur 68–85, online: .

Newman, Edward, "Human Security: Reconciling Critical Aspirations With Political 'Realities'" (2016) 56:6 Br J Criminol 1165–1183, online: .

Beyond the Global Agenda: State and Religious Non-state Actors' Responses to Human Security in Indonesia

Abubakar Eby Hara
International Relations Department, University of Jember, Indonesia
Email: eby-hara.fisip@unej.ac.id

Suyani Indriastuti
International Relations Department, University of Jember, Indonesia
Email: s_indriastuti.fisip@unej.ac.id

Agus Trihartono
International Relations Department, University of Jember, Indonesia
Email: atrihartono@unej.ac.id

Abstract

This article examines how state and religious non-state actors understand and make efforts to overcome human security challenges in Indonesia. The activities of these actors are largely outside the UNDP global human security agenda because they have been conducted long before the concept of human security was popularised. The authors seek to reinterpret the concept of human security as a paradigm to make it more attuned to the experience of the state and religious non-state actors when dealing with human security challenges in the Indonesian context. Data from primary and secondary sources gathered in Indonesia in 2021 reveals that religious motivations and environmental threats drive the agendas of religious non-state actors operating in Indonesia.

Keywords: *Human Security, Religious non-state actor, norm diffusion, UNDP, and Indonesia.*

I. INTRODUCTION

This article considers the extent to which the concept of human security, a widely accepted but problematic global norm, can be applied to formative political and policy challenges in Indonesia. The concept of human security is often seen as part of the global agenda to assist countries in need. However, the concept is rarely understood beyond the parameters of the global agenda, especially in the context of developing countries with their own histories and cultures. To understand global human security more fully, we need to explore the causes of humanitarian and other

crises, as well as how local community groups understand crises, what their motivations are, and how they attempt to overcome these challenges. For the purposes of our analysis, the local groups consisting of community organisations in a country need to be included as part of wider national networks of religious non-state actors competing for influence.

The role of religious non-state actors is rarely studied in the context of human security, although many articles have covered these actors' social concerns.[1] Through a reinterpretation of the human security concept, the authors show that Indonesia, through its religious non-state actors, continues to address various human security problems. Indonesia's experience can contribute to the global agenda for human security improvement that continues to be carried out through the UNDP. The case studies selected are three religious non-state organisations, namely the Christian organisation Bethesda and the two-mass membership Muslim organisations, Muhammadiyah and Nahdlatul Ulama (NU). These three organisations are unique because they have operated since the Dutch colonial era and continue to grow throughout Indonesia today. All three were born from different social and religious backgrounds and began with slightly contradictory motivations.

This study uses a qualitative approach, with data obtained from focus group discussions and interviews with purposively selected sources. Fieldwork was conducted in Jember, Jakarta and Aceh in September 2021. These three sites were chosen because of the presence of figures associated with religious non-state organisations and the level of severity of human security problems.

This article is structured as follows. Part II discusses the development of the human security approach as a global agenda and the reinterpretation the concept. Part III analyses the dilemma of the state in conducting human security operations in Indonesia. Part IV examines religious non-state actors in Indonesia, with evidence from case studies. Part V concludes the article.

II. REINTERPRETION OF THE HUMAN SECURITY PARADIGM

The idea of human security was developed by academics and human rights activists such as Amartya Sen, Mahbub ul Haq and Sadako Ogata, and was later adopted by

---

1 Greg Barton, "The Gülen Movement, Muhammadiyah and Nahdlatul Ulama: Progressive Islamic Thought, Religious Philanthropy and Civil Society in Turkey and Indonesia, Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations" (2014) 25:3 Islam Christ Relations 287–301, online: <https://www.tandfonline.com/action/journalInformation?journalCode=cicm20>; Monika Arnez, "Empowering Women Through Islam: Fatayat NU Between Tradition and Change" (2010) 21:1 J Islam Stud 59–88, online: <https://academic.oup.com/jis/article/21/1/59/722221>; H Ahmad Hijazi, "ISLAMIC EDUCATION in INDONESIA DURING the DUTCH COLONIAL; The Case Muhammadiyah and NU" (2011) 1:2 Madania J Ilmu-Ilmu Keislam 202–223, online: <http://ejournal.uin-suska.ac.id/index.php/madania/article/view/4687>; Faried F Saenong, "Nahdlatul Ulama (NU): A Grassroots Movement Advocating Moderate Islam" in Muhammad Afzal Upal & Carole M Cusack, eds, *Handb Islam Sects Movements* (Leiden: Brill, 2021) 129; Muhammad FUAD, "Civil Society in Indonesia: The Potential and Limits of Muhammadiyah" (2002) 17:2 Sojourn J Soc Issues Southeast Asia 133–163, online: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41057084>.

the UNDP. The UNDP defined seven human security elements that required attention, namely economic, environmental, food, health, political, personal, and community crises. Human security encompasses freedom from fear and violence, freedom from wants such as the availability of adequate health facilities, and freedom to live with dignity and human rights."[2] The 1994 UNDP Human Development Report contends that threats, harms and disruptions to daily life are not only faced by states but also communities and individuals within and beyond states.[3] States need to find the causes of vulnerabilities, try to address them, and take anticipatory steps to overcome them. Benefits to human security can include community engagement as well as respect for human dignity and human rights.[4] To address human security issues, the UNDP designs projects and initiatives in collaboration with donor countries.[5] This approach is endorsed by influential scholars such as Mary Kaldor.[6]

Over the past two decades, the ideology and norms of human security have been the driving normative force behind the global policies advocated by the United Nations in the field of security. International Organisations also adopt a range of policies to put human security principles into practice.[7] This started with the establishment of the Commission of Human Security in 2001 led by Sadako Ogata and Amartya Sen. The Commission was tasked with conducting public diplomacy, aimed at spreading the concept and norms of human security so that the public in various countries could understand, engage with and support the conception of human security. Furthermore, this Commission encouraged the development of the concept of human security as an operational tool for policy formulation and implementation in various countries. More specifically, this Commission also encouraged targeted programs to address the pressing and growing threats to human security.[8]

Several countries initiated the formation of the Human Security Network to create a dialogue forum for countries that have the same thoughts about human security. This forum has involved meetings at the Minister of Foreign Affairs level since 1999. One of the successes of this network was pushing for an international ban on antipersonnel mines at the United Nations. Current members of the Network are Austria, Chile, Costa Rica, Greece, Ireland, Jordan, Mali, Norway, Panama, Slovenia, Switzerland, and Thailand, with South Africa participating as observers.[9] The idea of

---

2   UNDP, *What is Human Security? – The Human Security Unit* (New York, 2019).
3   *Human Development Report 1994*, by UNDP (1994).
4   *Ibid.*
5   *Ibid.*
6   Mary Kaldor, "NATO and human security" (2022) 1 NDC Policy Br (NDC Policy Brief) 1–4, online: <https://www.ndc.nato.int/news/news.php?icode=1647>.
7   Jean Philippe Thérien, "Human Security: The Making of a UN Ideology" (2012) 26:2 http://dx.doi.org/101080/136008262012656265 191–213, online: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13600826.2012.656265>.
8   Amartya Sen, "Birth of a discourse" in Mary Martin & Taylor Owen, eds, *Routledge Handb Hum Secur* (2013).
9   Claudia F Fuentes Julio & Hans Günter Brauch, "The Human Security Network: A Global North-South Coalition BT - Facing Global Environmental Change: Environmental, Human, Energy, Food, Health and Water Security Concepts" in Hans Günter Brauch et al, eds, (Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 2009) 991.

human security is increasingly accepted and holds the promise of greater international cooperation.

Countries such as Japan, Canada and Norway officially include human security as part of their foreign policy agenda. In Canada, this agenda was primarily spearheaded by Lloyd Axworthy, foreign minister from 1996 and 2000. Axworthy made great efforts to shift the focus from state security to a more people-centred approach.[10] Canada pioneered the Mine Ban Treaty and the International Criminal Court. Several other countries including Canada reinterpreted the concept of human security, giving birth to a norm called the Responsibility to Protect (R2P). R2P defines the conditions for the international community to intervene against sovereign states by military and/or non-military means to protect citizens from genocide, war crimes, ethnic cleansing, and various other crimes against humanity.[11] Countries including Japan, Thailand and the Philippines have attempted to redefine human security to avoid confrontation between state sovereignty and humanitarian imperatives by emphasising prevention and sensitivity to local contexts.[12]

The view that human security needs to develop towards a more inclusive paradigm in understanding various phenomena of human security has been recognised from the beginning. In this initial view, the reorientation of human security as a new paradigm should not be limited to conflict and crisis when a country is in need. Alkire wrote about the need to look at human security from the needs of the community itself. As a security paradigm that departs from individual and community security, human security can be used to understand how a community defines the core of the security challenges they face and how they mobilise an institution to address these issues.[13] The most important element in human security is not generally defined threats, but people's reflection, based on their local experience and knowledge of their local values and needs.[14]

Several authors agree that the individual should get the main advantage as a security referent. As Newman argues, the mission and main agenda of the concept of human security is to advance and achieve human-centred security, whether by using the label 'human security' or not.[15] With a more contextual understanding, Newman shows that the human security concept can help identify the causes and sources behind deprivation and suffering experienced by community groups that could stem from structural and institutional problems that cause insecurity.[16] Wellman and

---

10 Robert J Hanlon & Kenneth Christie, *Freedom from Fear, Freedom from Want: An Introduction to Human Security* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016).

11 Jun Honna, "Japan and the Responsibility to Protect: coping with human security diplomacy" (2012) 25:1 https://doi.org/101080/095127482011632968 95–112, online: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09.512748.2011.632968>.

12 Yoichi Mine, Oscar A Gómez & Ako Muto, "Human Security in East Asia: Assembling a Puzzle" (2019) Hum Secur Norms East Asia 1–22.

13 *A Conceptual Framework for Human Security*, by Sabina Alkire, 2 (Oxford, 2003).

14 *Ibid.*

15 Edward Newman, "Human security" in Fen Osler Hampson, Alpaslan Özerdem & Jonathan Kent, eds, *Routledge Handb Peace, Secur Dev* (Routledge Handbooks Online, 2020) 33.

16 Edward Newman, "Human Security: Reconciling Critical Aspirations With Political 'Realities'" (2016) 56:6 Br J Criminol 1165–1183, online: <https://academic.oup.com/bjc/article/56/6/1165/2415309>.

Lombardi add that in certain cultural contexts, religion can contribute to human security and also pose a threat to human security.[17] Such contextual understanding allows for an explanation of the different definitions of security by state and non-state actors.

Shani points out that one of the main sources of human insecurity stems from the failure of countries, in the North as well as the South, to recognise the increasing cultural diversity of their populations resulting from globalisation and colonial heritage. Shani stresses the importance of bringing back culture and religion as a part of human security.[18] Culture and religion are what enable many individuals to enjoy a life that is endowed with meaning and dignity. The role of religion and identity allows the articulation of various conceptions of human security on their own terms.[19]

Many people in the developing world do not wait passively for international concerns to address human security problems that threaten their life and dignity. Religious institutions have long been active in the effort to overcome human security problems, at least amongst their followers. This relates to religious missions to protect and create prosperity for the people against the challenges they face. In parts of Africa, religion has been found to provide psychological security for some followers and also to help promote a sense of security for individuals and communities.[20] Religion can provide a sense of security and encourage its adherents to jointly fight to overcome alienation, poverty and a lack of education[21] This view is in contrast to some studies that see religion as threat to minority groups, which creates insecurity.[22] In UNDP language, feelings of insecurity arise in everyday life due to general concerns about having enough food and income and being free from torture and persecution on the grounds of gender, ethnicity or religion.[23]

---

17 Clark B Lombardi & Jr, James Wellman, "Introduction: Religion and Human Security: An Understudied Relationship" in Clark B Lombardi & James Wellman, eds, *Introd Relig Hum Secur An Understudied Relatsh (2012) James K Wellman, Jr Clark B Lomb eds, Relig Hum Secur A Glob Perspect* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012) 1.

18 Giorgio Shani, "Human security as ontological security: a post-colonial approach Article (Accepted version) (Refereed) Human Security as Ontological Security: A Post-Colonial Approach" (2017) 20:3 Postcolonial Stud 275–293, , p. 2. online: <http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/86919/>.

19 Giorgio Shani, "Human Security at Twenty: Civilizing Process or Civilizing Mission?" *E-International Relations* (19 June 2014). online: <https://www.e-ir.info/2014/06/19/human-security-at-twenty-civilizing-process-or-civilizing-mission/>.

20 *Faith based non-state actors in selected African countries: a comparative analysis of catholic and protestant schooling in the Democratic Republic of Congo, Rwanda, Tanzania, Madagascar and Cameroon*, by Annette Scheunpflug & Mark Wenz (2021).

21 Tarusarira Joram & Ezra Chitando, *Themes in Religion and Human Security in Africa*, Tarusarira Joram & Ezra Chitando, eds (ROUTLEDGE, 2022).

22 Brian J Grim & Roger Finke, "Religious Persecution in Cross-National Context: Clashing Civilizations or Regulated Religious Economies?" (2016) 72:4 https://doi.org/101177/000312240707200407 633–658, online: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/000312240707200407>.

23 *Human Development Report 1994*, by UNDP (Oxford, 1994).

Religion can be a form of social capital that can help the state overcome various human security problems.[24] As stated by Patriadi et al, who conducted research on Muslim boarding schools (*pesantren*) in East Java, Indonesia, the role of religious institutions can be compatible with human security.[25] The role of religious communities with deep roots in society (often pre-dating the establishment of modern states) is often overlooked in the human security literature. Wellman and Lombardi's edited book is among the few studies that discuss the relationship between religion and human security in terms of its contribution and challenge to theories of security.[26] Religion is seen to be related to dignity and the security to worship emotionally as human beings, which is linked to the freedom to live in dignity. Wellman and Lombardi identify two kinds of religious influence on human security. The first is the relationship between religion as a belief system and human security, and the second is the relationship between actions motivated by religion and human security.[27] In some countries, there are religious charitable bodies that help the poor.

In connection with the important role of religion, we can relate to Ako Muto's conclusion about human dignity and the need for empowerment from below. Human dignity is related to the third component of human security, the freedom to live with dignity. This element can generate added value from the human security approach because "dignity is an idea of waiting and caring".[28] The dignity component in the human security norm complex must be open to flexible adaptation. This is something that will require further in-depth analysis. Muto concludes that although the use of the term human security is not widespread, local norms of human security involving non-traditional security measures are emerging in many countries.[29]

Based on some of the above considerations, we find it reasonable to investigate how religious non-state actors contribute to human security outside of the often-discussed global context. This article examines the ways in which religious non-state actors play a role in empowering communities to overcome various threats related to fear, lack of food and poor health and self-esteem. There exists a competitive element among the actors in order to prevent being be left behind in attracting the masses by presenting activities that are most beneficial to their society. The competition occurred between Islamic organisations and the Christian organization Bethesda, as

---

24 Joram Tarusarira & Ezra Chitando, "Introduction : Themes in religion and human security in Africa" in Joram Tarusarira & Ezra Chitando, eds, *Themes Relig Hum Secur Africa* (Routledge, 2020) 1.

25 Himawan Bayu Patriadi, Mohd Zaini Abu Bakar & Zahri Hamat, "Human Security in Local Wisdom Perspective: Pesantren and its Responsibility to Protect People" (2015) 28 Procedia Environ Sci 100–105.

26 James K Wellman & Clark B Lombardi (eds), *Religion and human security : a global perspective* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012).

27 *Ibid.*

28 Ako Muto, "Human Security Norms in East Asia: Towards Conceptual and Operational Innovation – CESRAN International" (2020) 8:1 J Confl Transform Secur 68–85, online: <https://cesran.org/human-security-norms-in-east-asia-towards-conceptual-and-operational-innovation.html>.

29 *Ibid.*

well as between NU and Muhammadiyah in strengthening their respective identities and rallying supporters.

III. HUMAN SECURITY IN INDONESIA

The global human security agenda has been received with some enthusiasm in Indonesia.[30] There are efforts to institutionalise human security so that it has legal force, such as making the Indonesian Human Security Index and including it in the draft of the National Security Law.[31] However, what is interesting is that government officials understand the presence of this new concept, but they also say that Indonesia has adopted this in its Constitution and several regulations since independence in 1945. Such claims appear in almost all ministries where we conducted Focus Group Discussions. These ministries include the Ministry of Maritime Affairs and Investment, the Coordinating Ministry for Politics, Law and Security (Kementerian Koordinator Bidang Politik, Hukum, dan Keamanan – Kemenko Polhukham), the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (Kementerian Lingkungan Hidup dan Kehutanan – KLHK), and the Ministry of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions, and Transmigration (Kementerian Desa, Pembangunan Daerah Tertinggal, dan Transmigrasi - KDPDTT). In Capital Special Region (Daerah Khusus Ibukota – DKI) Jakarta Government, FGD was attended by the National Unity and Political Agency (Badan Kesatuan Bangsa dan Politik – Kesbangpol) of DKI Jakarta Province.

Officials from the Coordinating Ministry for Political, Legal and Security Affairs, for example, stated that the idea of human security was already present in the 1945 Constitution. To paraphrase, "as individuals and collectively, we, the Indonesian people, are already in the framework of human security. There are real similarities within the concept that preceded the UNDP concept".[32] The ministry also stated that in the Constitution, individuals are not only free from the threat of war and violence, but also free from fear, free from hunger, and free from homelessness. The same point was made by the Ministry of Environment and Forestry, where it was stated that the concept of human security already existed in the preamble to the 1945 Constitution, especially the section ensuring the welfare of the Indonesian people.[33] It is a generally held belief that the President of the Republic of Indonesia, Joko

---

30 Yudi Latif, "Keamanan Insani", *Republika Online* (29 August 2012), online: <https://www.republika.co.id/berita/kolom/resonansi/12/08/29/m9inf5-keamanan-insani>; Sutrimo, "PERLUKAH UU KAMNAS?" (2015) Special Edition Wira, online: <www.kemhan.go.id.>; *Indeks Keamanan Manusia Indonesia PENGEMBANGAN KONSEP INDEKS KEAMANAN MANUSIA INDONESIA 2015*, by Edy Prasetyono, Riefqi Muna & Mahmud Syaltout (Jakarta, 2015); Elpeni Fitrah, "Gagasan Human Security Dan Kebijakan Keamanan Nasional Indonesia" (2015) 2:01 Insign J Int Relations 27–41, online: <http://jos.unsoed.ac.id/index.php/insignia/article/view/434>; Kusnanto Anggoro, *Keamanan Nasional, Pertahanan Negara dan Ketertiban Umum* (Bappenas, 2003).

31 Prasetyono, Muna & Syaltout, *supra* note 30; Lina A Alexandra, "Perceptions on Human Security: An Indonesian View" in Yoichi Mine, Oscar A Gómez & Ako Muto, eds, *Hum Secur Norms East Asia* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2019) 67.

32 FDG at the Coordinating Ministry for Political, Legal and Security Affairs, Jakarta September 2021.

33 FGD at Ministry of Environment and Forestry September 2021.

Widodo, always emphasises human security, although the President tends to use simple language in some of his remarks, for example claiming that every activity must be in favour of the interests of the people.[34]

To understand how far these human security ideas and programs have been implemented, we can look at how far individuals or communities are protected and how far they have been sacrificed for the sake of unity or state security. The results of our study indicate that there are efforts towards individual protection but there are also obstacles that must be faced. Protecting individual security is therefore a dilemma for the state in Indonesia. Indonesia, like many other developing countries, faces various problems of national disintegration, including long-standing separatist movements and deep social divisions. The state approach is typically to maintain the unity, harmony, and integrity of the nation. In one of its national slogans, the unitary state of the Republic of Indonesia is said to have a "fixed price" (*NKRI harga mati*), which implies the need to maintain the territorial integrity of the Republic of Indonesia by any means necessary, including by violating the rights of civilians. In response, human rights organisations and activists have demanded that the government protect the rights of the people and not violate human rights when maintaining the integrity of the unitary state.

In the case of local conflicts, the government acts more to protect the harmony of life than to enforce individual rights. From our focus group with the Coordinating Ministry for Politics, Law and Security, for example, harmony is prioritised by the government and its subordinate apparatus.[35] In the establishment of places of worship for minorities, for example, the government seeks reconciliation, not by giving rights to minority groups, but by finding solutions by establishing places of worship in areas that are more acceptable to the people in the area. This is in line with the findings of Al Khanif's research that shows the government prioritises the voice of the majority in cases of inter-religious conflict.[36] In conflicts between sects in Islam, for example, the government restricts the right to freedom of religion for minority sects such as Shia and Ahmadiyah due to protests from the majority Sunni adherents in Indonesia. The Shia and Ahmadiyah groups often experience pressure and must receive protection from the state apparatus.[37]

Among minority Christians in Indonesia, threats of violence and even terrorist group bombings against churches occurred until 2021.[38] This threat is a serious security issue. In recent years the government, together with Islamic organisations such as the youth branch of NU, Banser, have anticipated attacks on churches, especially in the lead up to Christmas. The case of bombings and assault certainly disturbs the sense of security to be free to practice religious teachings as guaranteed in the Indonesian Constitution. Apart from the physical threats handled by the

---

34 *Ibid.*

35 FGD at Menko Polhukham September 2022

36 Al Khanif, *Religious minorities, Islam, and the law : international human rights and Islamic law in Indonesia*, 1st ed (Routledge, 2020).

37 *Ibid.*

38 Ferry Sandi, "Fakta-fakta Terbaru Bom Meledak di Depan Katedral Makassar", *CNBC Indones* (29 March 2021), online: <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20210329070922-4-233483/fakta-fakta-terbaru-bom-meledak-di-depan-katedral-makassar>.

security forces, there are also concerns about the space for religious education for Christian children. In one interview, our informants said they were not worried about Islamic schools being fostered by Muhammadiyah and NU because it was their territory, but were worried about state schools that were supported by the government. Public schools are expected to provide a secure space for Christians who want to send their children to school. Many still feel that Christian religious education for them in public schools is inadequate, as is protection for students who are sometimes bullied because they are a religious minority.[39]

The state also attempts to involve civil society in the management of inter-religious conflict through the Religious Harmony Forum (Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama - FKUB), which is the representative of all religious groups. The forums were formed in several provinces by local communities, facilitated by the state. In the Province of the Special Capital Region of Jakarta, the government tried to make this institution effective in arranging permits for the establishment of places of worship, so that it became a standard system. According to the head of the National Unity and Political Agency (Kesbangpol) in Jakarta, "with a standardised system, it is hoped that the Religious Harmony Forum will be able to resolve conflicts in the community regarding the construction of houses of worship, as well as other conflicts".[40] However, the activities and important roles of FKUB differ in different provinces depending on whether there is a threat to the stability of religious life or not. This body becomes active and necessary only when there is a possibility of horizontal conflict between religious followers.

The state also takes initiatives to address possible conflicts related to halal food. Halal products are regulated by Law No. 33 of 2014 concerning Guaranteed Halal Products. To give Muslims a sense of security, the government tasked the Ministry of Religious Affairs with enforcing stricter regulations for the labelling of halal products. "This halal labelling needs to be done to provide a sense of security for Muslims in choosing food".[41] Efforts to enforce this rule, however, have not been entirely smooth because in certain communities, the labelling process is difficult. People with large minority populations, such as those of Chinese descent in the provinces of Bangka Belitung and West Kalimantan, already have their own mechanisms to regulate halal products that are understood and accepted by the whole communities there. In Bali Province, the enforcement of halal labelling is often seen as an effort to Islamise, rather than an effort to regulate social life.[42]

---

39 Interview with Yan O Kalampung, Lecturer at Institut Agama Kristen Negeri Manado (State Christian Institute, Manado), and PhD Student at University of Leeds UK, 20 September 2022.

40 FGD with Kebangspol Pemda DKI.

41 Interview with M. Adlin Sila, Head of Research and Development of the Ministry of Religion

42 Dadan Kuswaraharja, "Kemenag: Wisata Halal Bukan Islamisasi Wisata", *DetikTravel* (21 November 2021), online: <https://travel.detik.com/travel-news/d-5820051/kemenag-wisata-halal-bukan-islamisasi-wisata>; Ahmad Baras & Muhammad Fakrudin, "Penolakan Simbol Islam di Bali | Republika Online", *Republika* (29 August 2014), online: <https://www.republika.co.id/berita/nb1xwa32/penolakan-simbol-islam-di-bali>.

The dilemma between sides with state security or public interest also occurs in the Ministry of Environment and Forestry.[43] The government wants to attract investment but needs to ensure that investors follow the existing Environmental Impact Analysis (Analisis Dampak Lingkungan or Amdal). However, environmental pollution still occurs near industrial and mining areas which has caused public protests. Community members are also very sensitive to the presence of companies in their area, so they tend to reject the presence of industrial factories. The Ministry of Environment and Forestry claims that they impose sanctions in case of environmental pollution and waste by companies.[44] The department has a special directorate for these matters called the Directorate General of Law Enforcement of the Ministry of Environment and Forestry.

The problem of harmony is emphasised when there are conflicts related to environmental issues. Sources from the Ministry of Environment and Forestry claim that the role of the government is to create stability and order.[45] The government seems to be careful not to deal directly with the people when there is a dilemma between solving environmental problems and the people's economic interests. In tin mining areas such as Bangka Belitung Islands Province, for example, conflicts occur between communities. Mining groups in the community need their mines to meet economic needs, but this often damages the environment, which is very important for local fishermen and farmers. Damage to the marine environment due to mining makes it difficult for fishermen to fish, while mining on land destroys river flows and agricultural land. The local government is more likely to wait and see in such conflicts and try to regulate mining in accordance with existing regulations and begin to design city plans to regulate areas that can and cannot be used for mining.[46]

The Indonesian government also established the Ministry of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration to help lift the economies of disadvantaged areas since 2000. Under this ministry, the government helped establish Village Owned Enterprises (Badan Usaha Milik Desa - BumDes) in various underdeveloped villages. There are several programs to raise the standard of living in disadvantaged villages, especially in Maluku and East Nusa Tenggara. Various forms of assistance are provided, for instance building a coconut oil processing plant and distributing special allocation funds for rural transportation.[47]

---

43 In addition to political and environmental problems, the human security dilemma faced by the government also occurs in managing health related to smoking. The Indonesian government accepts the global anti-smoking norm but in practice, it often pays more attention to the interests of tobacco farmers and cigarette entrepreneurs than public health. This is because they provide a large tax revenue for the government. See Suyani Indriastuti, Abubakar Eby Hara, Himawan Bayu Patriadi, Agus Trihartono, Bagus Sigit Sunarko, "Health versus Economic Security: An Ambivalence of Anti-Tobacco Norm Internalisation in Indonesia" (2022) 18:1, *Journal of Human Security* 5-17.

44 FGD at the Ministry of Environment and Forestry.

45 *Ibid.*

46 Interview with Director General of Law Enforcement of the Ministry of Environment and Forestry, Ratio Ridho Sani, September 2021.

47 FGD in the Harmonization of Facilities and Infrastructure Development Section, KDPDTT, September 2021.

Government efforts are still not sufficient when addressing the various problems of poverty for a country as large as Indonesia. Community participation in NGOs, for example, is very necessary, especially if the state is seen as unable to fulfil a sense of security in the community in terms of health services, education, economic access for the poor, and the protection of human rights.[48] Some NGOs are trying to tackle poverty and are able to mobilise public funds to deal with sudden humanitarian crises caused by natural disasters such as earthquakes and droughts.[49]

Although the government has taken steps to overcome several human security problems, their capabilities are limited. Therefore, from the start, people could not wait or expect too much from the government to solve their problems. The government itself often has its own problems, especially in prioritising security between state security and human security. In the next section, we look at the growth of religious non-state actors starting in the pre-independence era. Attention will mainly be paid to the motivation of the activities designed to empower the community, the efforts made and the possibility of competition between these organisations.

IV. RELIGIOUS NON-STATE ACTORS: CASE STUDIES

The three organisations discussed here – Bethesda, Muhammadiyah and NU – have their own arenas, own networks and audiences. Accordingly, the possibility of them grappling over their congregations is small. They originated from different cultures, religions and followers. Bethesda is a Christian organisation that was established earlier and received some assistance from the Dutch colonial government. After independence, it received support from several donor agencies and partners from abroad.[50] Muhammadiyah was established in traditional Islamic circles like NU, but has since attracted broad support from urban Muslims for its modernization ideas. NU was established from Islamic circles who are often considered traditional, with a rural religious boarding school (*pesantren*) base. Muhammadiyah and NU get funds mainly from members and supporters, through appeals based on religious teachings, asking people who are well off to help the poor and needy. Several activities of the women's branch of NU's Fatayat also received assistance from foreign foundations.[51] The origins, philosophies and practices of these religious non-state actors reveal antecedents to the modern concept of human security.

---

48 Bob Hadiwinata, "Poverty and the role of ngos in protecting human security in indonesia" (2017) Non-Traditional Secur Asia Dilemmas Secur 198–224, online: <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/chapters/edit/10.4324/9781315247878-17/poverty-role-ngos-protecting-human-security-indonesia-bob-hadiwinata>.

49 *Ibid.*

50 Interview with Yan O. Kalampung, lecturer at Manado State Christian Institute and PhD Student at University of Leeds, Leeds 20 September 2022. Also see CD-Bethesda official web: https://www.cdbethesda.org/ The concept of shalom comes from the Hebrew language, but it is also often used in Indonesia by followers of Christianity in churches. The government also uses the word shalom to honor Christians in official state speeches.

51 Arnez, *supra* note 1.

The main characteristic of these mass organisations is their intention to overcome the threats of poverty, health and morality. This concern is driven by religious awareness, both to maintain identity and traditions of the organisations and to overcome humanitarian issues. All religions have teachings and mechanisms to help those who are in need. In Christianity, many charitable organisations reflect the values of philanthropy and social generosity. In particular, the concept of *shalom*, which can be interpreted as providing a sense of security of self and others, encourages various activities including collecting aid funds for poor people in the diakonia concept.[52] In Islam, there are teachings called *zakat, infaq* and *sodaqoh,* which mean contributions to the poor and needy. Reinterpretations of religious teachings, especially so that humans try to change their own destiny rather than surrender to destiny, have been carried out by these religious organisations.[53] Although these organisations are motivated by religious teachings and concerns, they try to embrace all groups to carry out what can be referred to as their human security agenda.[54]

Early followers of Christianity showed their concern for human security by establishing hospitals. Bethesda, founded in 1896, was originally a Protestant hospital named Petronella and was founded in Yogyakarta. Bethesda inspired the founding of another Christian organisation named Panti Rapih, which was founded by Carolus Barromeus and his brothers. They established the Onder de Bogen hospital, which was renamed Panti Rapih in Yogyakarta in 1929, in addition to hospital projects in several cities. These Christian hospitals provide free health services for the poor.[55] Bethesda's activities have expanded beyond health, for example with the establishment of an NGO called CD-Bethesda. Panti Rapih also has several social activities but the concentration on health is greater.

Bethesda has received special attention because of its long-established role, starting from helping public health to social and political problems during the 1997 financial crisis in Indonesia. As Hadiwinata said, Bethesda, which initially concentrated on improving public health, later also formed a kind of NGO that dealt with improving community welfare since 1974. Initially, the NGO called CD-Bethesda Pembangunan Desa Yogyakarta, only helped people who did not have access to health care through the formation of village health cadres (Kader Kesehatan Desa - KKD). CD-Bethesda recruits and trains thousands of villagers to provide health care for their own neighbourhoods. As of 2001, the organisation claims to have recruited and trained 3,200 KKD in Yogyakarta and Central Java.[56]

Bethesda's mandate expanded in response to deteriorating economic conditions in Indonesia. Its NGO took the initiative to overcome poverty and help people in

---

52 Interview with Yan O. Kalampung, Leeds, 20 September 2022. Diakonia concept basically is the concept to help those who are weak in economy among the church members.

53 Interview with Abdul Mu'ti, one of prominent figures in Muhammadiyah September 2021 and Yan O Kalampung, IAKN lecturer, September 2022.

54 Amelia Fauzia, "Penolong Kesengsaraan Umum: The charitable activism of Muhammadiyah during the colonial period" (2017) 25:4 https://doi.org/101177/0967828X17740458 379–394, online: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0967828X17740458?journalCode=sera>.

55 *Ibid.*

56 Hadiwinata, *supra* note 47.

villages to actively participate in controlling the management of village funds through the Regional Development Agency (Badan Pembangunan Desa - BPD). Its activists invited the public to be critical of the misuse of village funds by village officials for political interests and even their families, saying that abuse creates insecurity for the poor. As Andreas Subiyono, executive director of CD-Bethesda put it: "we simply cannot let the poor people become the victims of the greedy local leaders who disburse development funds for their political and personal purposes. Thus, we must take development (initiatives) away from these swindlers and speculators and give them back to the people".[57] For this purpose, all village health cadres transformed their activities and joined a newly formed Bethesda organisation called the People's Organisations (Organisasi Rakyat - ORA). Here they trained their members to be active in democracy, negotiation, ideology, and conflict resolution. They also fight for their representatives to be elected as members of the Regional Development Agency. These activities help the community to be more involved in determining the direction of development and the use of village funds, especially when overcoming poverty. They can function as checks and balances at the village level and determine the direction of development priorities for their village.[58]

The establishment of Bethesda and Panti Rapih during the Dutch era was followed by several Islamic organisations throughout Indonesia. Islamic organisations such as the Syarikat Dagang Islam (SDI) and Muhammadiyah were established because of the Dutch government's neglect of their colonial subjects, who were generally Muslim. Concern about human security emerged because the colonial state exacerbated various human security problems. The Cultivation Policy or "Cultuurstelsel", for example, had the effect of prolonged poverty. Apart from this, trade policies that favoured foreign arrivals such as merchants from China, for example, made native traders worried. Thus, before human security was promoted by the UNDP, the issue of human security was a concern for the Indonesian people.

The earliest established Islamic organisation was the Islamic Trade Union or Syarikat Dagang Islam (SDI) in 1905. This organisation supported the economic, social and trade situation of Muslims. They were ostensibly threatened by foreign traders working with the Dutch colonialists. According to Makin, the SDI aimed to increase the self-esteem of the Indonesian Muslim people in the face of competition in the batik fabric industry, namely with Chinese traders and the Javanese aristocratic class supporting the interests of the Dutch.[59] Then, under the leadership of Tjokroaminoto, this organisation changed its name to Syarikat Islam (SI) and fought for the fate of the people not only in the economic field, but socially, religiously and politically, especially against poverty and oppression. As Tjokroaminoto states, Islam is a religion for the poor and oppressed, or in his terms in Dutch "de Islam is de

---

57 *Ibid.*

58 *Ibid.*

59 Al Makin, "Haji Omar Said Tjokroaminoto: Islam and Socialism (Indonesia, 1924/1963)" in Björn Bentlage et al, eds, *Relig Dyn under Impact Imp Colon* (Brill, 2017) 249.

godsdienst can de armen en de verdrukten".[60] After Indonesian independence in 1945, this organisation became a less successful political party.

Muhammadiyah was founded in 1912 in Yogyakarta as a religious-based charitable organisation with activities focussed on establishing schools, orphanages, hospitals and improving impoverished. This was motivated by the harm caused by the Dutch policy of Forced Cultivation (1830–1912) that contributed to poverty, ignorance, a decline in the health of the population, the destruction of religious beliefs, and a rise in orphans. Muhammadiyah figure Abdul Mu'ti claims that "the first encounter that made him (the founder of Muhammadiyah KH Achmad Dahlan) so called upon was because of serious social problems, namely poverty, ignorance and social disintegration".[61] These three issues later became the starting point for Muhammadiyah's work.

Achmad Dahlan, the founder of Muhammadiyah, saw that the Dutch colonialists, unlike the British, did not want to invest in things that did not directly benefit them, such as education. This prompted Dahlan to bring education, which previously was only based on traditional religious education at *pesantren* in rural areas, into a modern school in urban areas. The Dutch colonial government was neither able nor interested in doing this. With this background and appeal, the Muhammadiyah movement developed rapidly. The network of Muhammadiyah schools, for example, has grown from kindergarten to university level. According to Barton, Muhammadiyah schools at the beginning were like Protestant and Catholic schools founded by religious philanthropic foundations during the Dutch East Indies era.[62] Together with these Christian schools, they gave birth to many educated people who could work in the service sector, with some becoming nationalist leaders of the Indonesian independence movement.

Dahlan and his wife Aisiyah carried out social reform movements which included religious teachings. As Abdul Mu'ti states, it was an internal problem for Muslims at that time who accepted their fate of poverty without trying to fix it.[63] For Dahlan, religion needed to be interpreted and put in motion, especially with regards to social movements to overcome ignorance and poverty. Muhammadiyah asks its members to make donations based on a religious principle known as *fastabiqul khairat*, namely competing in doing good. One of the charitable activities was initially carried out through its branch called Assistance for the Relief of Public Suffering (Penolong Kesengsaraan Umum, PKU).[64] PKU in its doctrine and implementation is inclusive regardless of religious groups. Nowadays, PKU, which now stands for Pembinaan Kesejahteraan Umat (Fostering the Welfare of the People), has hospitals in almost every province in Indonesia and provides services to everyone. This principle was formulated since its inception in the Dutch colonial period.[65]

---

60 Ajid Thohir et al, "The Struggle Of Freemasonry And Islamic Ideology In The Twentieth Century During Colonialization In Indonesia" (2021) 7:10 Heliyon.
61 Interview with Abdul Mu'ti September 2021.
62 Barton, *supra* note 1.
63 Interview with Abdul Mu'ti, September 2021.
64 Fauzia, *supra* note 53.
65 FUAD, *supra* note 1.

The involvement of Dahlan's wife Aisiyah shows the idea that women should also play a role in philanthropy activities, as men do. Dahlan considers women as independent human beings, as responsible and accountable for their own actions as men, meaning that they should be given access and opportunities to acquire religious knowledge. Muhammadiyah then founded Aisyiyah, the women's branch of Muhammadiyah in Yogyakarta in 1917, and it is recognised as one of the oldest Muslim women's organisations in Indonesia.[66]

Muhammadiyah raises public funds to assist emergency humanitarian crises due to natural disasters and social violence that causes displacement, issues that align very much with the contemporary human security agenda. For example, Muhammadiyah helped Shia refugees in Madura who were being persecuted because of their beliefs, which were considered to deviate from Islamic teachings. Through the Muhammadiyah Disaster Management Centre, they raised funds and provided counselling and educational assistance to children whose parents experienced physical and psychological stress because of their beliefs. In addition, the disaster centre was active in helping victims of the 2004 tsunami in Aceh and 2006 earthquake relief in Yogyakarta.[67]

Muhammadiyah's activities in the post-colonial period were also motivated by concerns that Bethesda and other Christian organisations were developing Christian teachings across Indonesia. Some Muhammadiyah followers suspected that the charitable activities of Christian organisations were a covert effort to carry out Christianisation. However, with the passing of time, these suspicions and anxieties seemed to be rather baseless, in part because Indonesia remains 86.9% Muslim,[68] and in part because government regulations prohibit *da'wah* to those who already have an official religion. The main regulations are the Joint Decree of the Minister of Religion and the Minister of Home Affairs No. 1 of 1979, Ministry of Religion No. 70 of 1978 concerning Guidelines for Religious Broadcasting and the Decree of the Minister of Religion and the Minister of Home Affairs No. 1 of 1979 concerning Procedures for the Implementation of Religious Broadcasting and Foreign Assistance to Religious Institutions in Indonesia.[69] Although these regulations are often criticised by human rights activists because they are considered a violation of the principle of religious freedom guaranteed by the Constitution,[70] the government uses them as a reference to maintain the harmony of social life.

The third mass membership organisation discussed in this paper is Nahdlatul Ulama (NU), which literary means "the awakening of the ulama". It was founded in 1926 by KH. Hasyim Asy'ari and several Islamic clerics (*ulama*) who opposed

---

66 Arnez, *supra* note 1.

67 Hilman Latief, "Philanthropy and 'Muslim Citizenship' in Post-Suharto Indonesia" (2016) 5:2 Southeast Asian Stud 269–286.

68 Dimas Bayu, "Sebanyak 86,9% Penduduk Indonesia Beragama Islam", (16 February 2022), online: *Kemendagri* <https://dataindonesia.id/ragam/detail/sebanyak-869-penduduk-indonesia-beragama-islam>.

69 Michael Hasudungan, "Pengaturan Penyiaran Agama di Indonesia dalam Perspektif Keadilan Bermartabat" (2020) 4:1 J Ilmu Huk Aleth 57–74, online: <https://ejournal.uksw.edu/alethea/article/view/4671>.

70 *Ibid.*

colonialism. The clerical movement fortified Muslims in various rural and village *pesantren* to oppose ideas seemingly influenced by colonial thought. NU propagates and defends Aswaja (ahlussunah wal-jamaah, which is a Sunni sect in Islam) through the Tashwirul Afkar magazine and its youth and women's organisations, such as Ansor, Banser, Fatayat, and Muslimat. The results of the deliberation and various thoughts of the clerics were disseminated in NU organisational bodies at the regional, branch and village levels.[71]

NU was also established as a reaction to the birth of Muhammadiyah, which at that time carried the torch of reform in various social and educational fields. This was considered a threat to NU followers who use traditional education in *pesantren*, and to some religious traditions in NU. Muhammadiyah was considered to reduce the authority of the clerics, and wanted to change the traditional *pesantren* education system which focused on religious education and entrepreneurship to a modern education system. It was feared that the spread of Muhammadiyah-style education would cause people to leave *pesantren*, eroding NU's influence in society.[72] Facing this challenge and facing modernity, education at NU has gradually adopted several national curricula to equip students to compete nationally.

Like Muhammadiyah, NU also grows rapidly in its social and humanitarian actions, foreshadowing the contemporary human security agenda. This organisation establishes facilities such as hospitals and health services, educational institutions from kindergartens to universities, empowers farmer groups, and many other activities. NU also provides services for non-members. Under the leadership of Ahmad Siddiq and Abdurrahman Wahid, NU officially accepted the state ideology Pancasila in 1984, which was enforced by the New Order regime under Suharto. With these various activities, NU continues to strengthen its national vision. NU's activities are carried out voluntarily and its activists do not receive official salaries.[73]

NU generally lags behind Muhammadiyah in the range of social activities it offers. In response, NU has created several social organisations, branches of NU, which cover almost all social and economic fields, from education to agriculture. For educational institutions, NU has the Nahdhatul Ulama Da'wah Institute for Islamic propagation, as well as the Ma'arif Nahdhatul Ulama Educational Institution. For health activities, NU has the Nahdlatul Ulama Health Service Institute. In the economic field, they have the Nahdlatul Ulama Economic Institute, the Nahdlatul Ulama Agricultural Development Institute, and the Rabithah Ma'ahid Islamiyah Nahdlatul Ulama specifically for their Islamic boarding school network. In addition, they run the Nahdlatul Ulama Human Resources Study and Development Institute. To fund these activities, NU has the Lajnah Auqaf Nahdlatul Ulama, Lajnah Zakat, Infaq, and Shadaqah Nahdlatul Ulama for charity.[74] These institutions are quite helpful for people in need, although in some respects their management structures and human resources are still not as professional or advanced as Muhammadiyah.

---

71 Ajid Thohir et al, "The struggle of Freemasonry and Islamic ideology in the twentieth century during colonialization in Indonesia" (2021) 7:10 Heliyon e08237.

72 Barton, *supra* note 1.

73 Saenong, *supra* note 1.

74 (Saenong, 2021, p. 138-139)

NU has a women's branch called Fatayat NU. Fatayat focusses their efforts into raising awareness about women's equality and helping women understand the various health and social problems they face. It helps its members to understand reproductive health issues such as pregnancy and the risks involved, nutrition for pregnant women and toddlers, and the use of contraceptives, which are related to the government's family planning program.[75] Fatayat also raises awareness about gender equality by taking initiatives to fight domestic violence against women in several districts throughout Indonesia. Its activists provide consultation, guidance, information and advocacy to the wider community, familiarises them with women's rights and provides counselling to victims of violence. Another program from Fatayat NU is its effort to overcome the problem of human trafficking, and prevent female migrant workers from becoming victims of inhumane working conditions in Middle Eastern and Asian countries such as Saudi Arabia, Malaysia, and Singapore, where they travel to seek better wages.[76]

One of the reasons for the formation of NU was to stem the growing influence of Muhammadiyah in the fields of religion and education. Muhammadiyah is considered by some to be destroying religious traditions and the content of traditional education, which has long been secure among the Indonesian people, especially among the NU *pesantren*. The opposition of these two groups has been raised for quite a long time, but not to the prolonged social conflict. Eventually, these two organisations realised that they came from the same Sunni sect and their differences were only surface level of religious views and not principal. In the contemporary social and political situation, where there are emerging radical views among Islam that even lead to violence against other groups, Muhammadiyah and NU are both seen as moderate, and as pioneers of a tolerant and harmonious society in Indonesia.

From the analysis of Indonesian religious non-state actors, the issue of human security has become a public concern carried out by religious institutions in the community. The state only acts as a regulator and often does not have a specific policy in the direction of protecting human security. In the case of the three religious organisations discussed here, they have become accustomed to anticipating human security threats that the state does not enough capacity to handle. These organisations have been dealing with human security problems since colonial times. There is a continuous human security threat that they face and because of that the civil society organisations they create continue to be relevant. In this context, the global human security agenda can be linked to the projects of religious non-state actors.

V. CONCLUSION

This article shows that the concept of human security can be extended beyond its global agenda to discuss efforts to address various individual and community security issues that have long been carried out on the initiative of the state and society itself. In the context of the government, Indonesia from the outset faced a dilemma between upholding national stability and unity and protecting individual rights. In

---

75 Arnez, *supra* note 1.

76 *Ibid.*

many cases, individual rights are still eclipsed by the importance of state security. Because not all human security matters can be carried out by the state, the above-mentioned social organisations emerged.

The three religious non-state actors discussed in this article are Bethesda, Muhammadiyah and NU, forming a core part of the effort to deal with human security problems since Dutch colonial times. Their activities are at times outside the global human security agenda promoted by UNDP, but they are nonetheless very important because they understand the real suffering of society both in terms of freedom from fear, from want and from indignity. To explain this, we attempted to reinterpret the concept of human security as a paradigm that is more contextual and sensitive to problems in developing countries based on previous scholarly criticisms of the concept itself.

With this reinterpretation, we hope to contribute to the development of human security as a global approach. The approach needs to consider the efforts to overcome human security pertinent issues in a specific local context. Concern over human suffering is an ongoing problem that needs to be addressed. The presence of the religious organisations discussed in this article, which has continued to grow since the colonial era, shows that their mass organisations have relevance in assisting the people's need for freedom and protection. These organisations have succeeded in translating the essence of religious values and teachings to meet the challenges of humanity to achieve these freedoms. This is an important example of how religion must appear in the midst of various complex threats to human security.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Alexandra, Lina A, "Perceptions on Human Security: An Indonesian View" in Yoichi Mine, Oscar A Gómez & Ako Muto, eds, Hum Secur Norms East Asia (Palgrave Macmillan, 2019) 67.

Alkire, Sabina, A Conceptual Framework for Human Security, by Sabina Alkire, 2 (Oxford, 2003).

Anggoro, Kusnanto, Keamanan Nasional, Pertahanan Negara dan Ketertiban Umum (Bappenas, 2003).

Arnez, Monika, "Empowering Women Through Islam: Fatayat NU Between Tradition and Change" (2010) 21:1 J Islam Stud 59–88, online: <https://academic.oup.com/jis/article/21/1/59/722221>.

Baras, Ahmad & Muhammad Fakrudin, "Penolakan Simbol Islam di Bali | Republika Online", Republika (29 August 2014), online: <https://www.republika.co.id/berita/nb1xwa32/penolakan-simbol-islam-di-bali>.

Barton, Greg, "The Gülen Movement, Muhammadiyah and Nahdlatul Ulama: Progressive Islamic Thought, Religious Philanthropy and Civil Society in

Turkey and Indonesia, Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations" (2014) 25:3 Islam Christ Relations 287–301, online: <https://www.tandfonline.com/action/journalInformation?journalCode=cicm20>.

Bayu, Dimas, "Sebanyak 86,9% Penduduk Indonesia Beragama Islam", (16 February 2022), online: Kemendagri <https://dataindonesia.id/ragam/detail/sebanyak-869-penduduk-indonesia-beragama-islam>.

Fauzia, Amelia, "Penolong Kesengsaraan Umum: The charitable activism of Muhammadiyah during the colonial period" (2017) 25:4 https://doi.org/101177/0967828X17740458 379–394, online: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0967828X17740458?journalCode=sera>.

Fitrah, Elpeni, "Gagasan Human Security Dan Kebijakan Keamanan Nasional Indonesia" (2015) 2:01 Insign J Int Relations 27–41, online: <http://jos.unsoed.ac.id/index.php/insignia/article/view/434>.

Fuad, Muhammad, "Civil Society in Indonesia: The Potential and Limits of Muhammadiyah" (2002) 17:2 Sojourn J Soc Issues Southeast Asia 133–163, online: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41057084>.

Grim, Brian J & Roger Finke, "Religious Persecution in Cross-National Context: Clashing Civilizations or Regulated Religious Economies?" (2016) 72:4 https://doi.org/101177/000312240707200407 633–658, online: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/000312240707200407>.

Hadiwinata, Bob, "Poverty and the role of NGOs in protecting human security in indonesia" (2017) Non-Traditional Secur Asia Dilemmas Secur 198–224, online: <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/chapters/edit/10.4324/9781315247878-17/poverty-role-ngos-protecting-human-security-indonesia-bob-hadiwinata>.

Hanlon, Robert J & Kenneth Christie, Freedom from Fear, Freedom from Want: An Introduction to Human Security (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016).

Hasudungan, Michael, "Pengaturan Penyiaran Agama di Indonesia dalam Perspektif Keadilan Bermartabat" (2020) 4:1 J Ilmu Huk Aleth 57–74, online: <https://ejournal.uksw.edu/alethea/article/view/4671>.

Hijazi, H Ahmad, "ISLAMIC EDUCATION in INDONESIA DURING the DUTCH COLONIAL; The Case Muhammadiyah and NU" (2011) 1:2 Madania J Ilmu-Ilmu Keislam 202–223, online: <http://ejournal.uin-suska.ac.id/index.php/madania/article/view/4687>.

Honna, Jun, "Japan and the Responsibility to Protect: coping with human security diplomacy" (2012) 25:1 https://doi.org/101080/095127482011632968 95–112, online: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09512748.2011.632968>.

Indriastuti, Suyani, Abubakar Eby Hara, Himawan Bayu Patriadi, Agus Trihartono & Bagus Sigit Sunarko, "Health versus Economic Security: An Ambivalence of Anti-Tobacco Norm Internalisation in Indonesia" (2022) 18:1 Journal of Human Security 5-17.

Joram, Tarusarira & Ezra Chitando, Themes in Religion and Human Security in Africa, Tarusarira Joram & Ezra Chitando, eds (ROUTLEDGE, 2022).

Julio, Claudia F Fuentes & Hans Günter Brauch, "The Human Security Network: A Global North-South Coalition BT - Facing Global Environmental Change: Environmental, Human, Energy, Food, Health and Water Security Concepts" in Hans Günter Brauch et al, eds, (Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 2009) 991.

Kaldor, Mary, "NATO and human security" (2022) 1 NDC Policy Br (NDC Policy Brief) 1–4, online: <https://www.ndc.nato.int/news/news.php?icode=1647>.

Khanif, Al, Religious minorities, Islam, and the law: international human rights and Islamic law in Indonesia, 1st ed (Routledge, 2020).

Kuswaraharja, Dadan, "Kemenag: Wisata Halal Bukan Islamisasi Wisata", DetikTravel (21 November 2021), online: <https://travel.detik.com/travel-news/d-5820051/kemenag-wisata-halal-bukan-islamisasi-wisata>.

Latief, Hilman, "Philanthropy and 'Muslim Citizenship' in Post-Suharto Indonesia" (2016) 5:2 Southeast Asian Stud 269–286.

Latif, Yudi, "Keamanan Insani", Republika Online (29 August 2012), online: <https://www.republika.co.id/berita/kolom/resonansi/12/08/29/m9inf5-keamanan-insani>.

Lombardi, Clark B & Jr, James Wellman, "Introduction: Religion and Human Security: An Understudied Relationship" in Clark B Lombardi & James Wellman, eds, Introd Relig Hum Secur An Understudied Relatsh (2012) James K Wellman, Jr Clark B Lomb eds, Relig Hum Secur A Glob Perspect (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012) 1.

Makin, Al, "Haji Omar Said Tjokroaminoto: Islam and Socialism (Indonesia, 1924/1963)" in Björn Bentlage et al, eds, Relig Dyn under Impact Imp Colon (Brill, 2017) 249.

Mine, Yoichi, Oscar A Gómez & Ako Muto, "Human Security in East Asia: Assembling a Puzzle" (2019) Hum Secur Norms East Asia 1–22.

Muto, Ako, "Human Security Norms in East Asia: Towards Conceptual and Operational Innovation – CESRAN International" (2020) 8:1 J Confl Transform Secur 68–85, online: <https://cesran.org/human-security-norms-in-east-asia-towards-conceptual-and-operational-innovation.html>.

Newman, Edward, "Human Security: Reconciling Critical Aspirations With Political 'Realities'" (2016) 56:6 Br J Criminol 1165–1183, online: <https://academic.oup.com/bjc/article/56/6/1165/2415309>.

——, "Human security" in Fen Osler Hampson, Alpaslan Özerdem & Jonathan Kent, eds, Routledge Handb Peace, Secur Dev (Routledge Handbooks Online, 2020) 33.

Patriadi, Himawan Bayu, Mohd Zaini Abu Bakar & Zahri Hamat, "Human Security in Local Wisdom Perspective: Pesantren and its Responsibility to Protect People" (2015) 28 Procedia Environ Sci 100–105.

Prasetyono, Edy, Riefqi Muna & Mahmud Syaltout, Indeks Keamanan Manusia Indonesia PENGEMBANGAN KONSEP INDEKS KEAMANAN MANUSIA INDONESIA 2015, by Edy Prasetyono, Riefqi Muna & Mahmud Syaltout (Jakarta, 2015).

Saenong, Faried F, "Nahdlatul Ulama (NU): A Grassroots Movement Advocating Moderate Islam" in Muhammad Afzal Upal & Carole M Cusack, eds, Handb Islam Sects Movements (Leiden: Brill, 2021) 129.

Sandi, Ferry, "Fakta-fakta Terbaru Bom Meledak di Depan Katedral Makassar", CNBC Indones (29 March 2021), online: <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20210329070922-4-233483/fakta-fakta-terbaru-bom-meledak-di-depan-katedral-makassar>.

Scheunpflug, Annette & Mark Wenz, Faith based non-state actors in selected African countries: a comparative analysis of catholic and protestant schooling in the Democratic Republic of Congo, Rwanda, Tanzania, Madagascar and Cameroon, by Annette Scheunpflug & Mark Wenz (2021).

Sen, Amartya, "Birth of a discourse" in Mary Martin & Taylor Owen, eds, Routledge Handb Hum Secur (2013).

Shani, Giorgio, "Human security as ontological security: a post-colonial approach Article (Accepted version) (Refereed) Human Security as Ontological Security: A Post-Colonial Approach" (2017) 20:3 Postcolonial Stud 275–293, online: <http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/86919/>.

——, "Human Security at Twenty: Civilizing Process or Civilizing Mission?" E-International Relations (19 June 2014), online: <https://www.e-ir.info/2014/06/19/human-security-at-twenty-civilizing-process-or-civilizing-mission/>.

Sutrimo, "PERLUKAH UU KAMNAS?" (2015) Special Edition Wira, online: <www.kemhan.go.id.>.

Tarusarira, Joram & Ezra Chitando, "Introduction : Themes in religion and human security in Africa" in Joram Tarusarira & Ezra Chitando, eds, Themes Relig Hum Secur Africa (Routledge, 2020) 1.

Thérien, Jean Philippe, "Human Security: The Making of a UN Ideology" (2012) 26:2 http://dx.doi.org/101080/13600826201265626 191–213, online: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13600826.2012.656265>.

Thohir, Ajid et al, "The struggle of Freemasonry and Islamic ideology in the twentieth century during colonialization in Indonesia" (2021) 7:10 Heliyon e08237.

———, "The Struggle Of Freemasonry And Islamic Ideology In The Twentieth Century During Colonialization In Indonesia" (2021) 7:10 Heliyon.

UNDP, Human Development Report 1994, by UNDP (1994).

———, What is Human Security? – The Human Security Unit (New York, 2019).

Wellman, James K & Clark B Lombardi (eds), Religion and human security : a global perspective (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012).

Acknowledgments

Abubakar Eby Hara PhD is Associate Professor in International Relations Department, University of Jember Indonesia. He graduated from Australian National University and was a Visiting Lecturer at Universiti Utara Malaysia. Currently he also a researcher at Centre for Research in Social Sciences and Humanities (C-RiSSH), University of Jember. His interests are on International Relations Theory, Politics in Southeast Asia and Human Security.

Suyani Indriastuti PhD is Head of International Relations Department, University of Jember Indonesia. She graduated from University of Nottingham, UK. Currently she is also Director of Centre for Human Security, University of Jember. Her interests are on International Human Security, International Trade and International Agrobusiness.

Agus Trihartono PhD is Associate Professor in International Relations Department, University of Jember Indonesia. He graduated from Ritsumeikan University, Kyoto, Japan. Currently he is also Director of Centre for Gastrodiplomacy Studies, University of Jember. His interests are on Human Security, Regionalism, and Soft Power.